

**TARGETING ARMED VIOLENCE:
IMPLICATIONS OF LOCALIZED EFFORTS TO CONTROL SMALL ARMS
PROLIFERATION AND MISUSE IN THE FORMER YUGOSLAVIA**

A Thesis
Presented to the Faculty
Of
The Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy

By
Sarah Beila Chankin-Gould

In partial fulfillment of the requirements for the
Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

December 2014

Dissertation Committee
Dr. Robert L. Pfaltzgraff, Jr., Chair
Dr. Richard Shultz
Dr. William C. Martel

Sarah Beila Chankin-Gould

Born Los Angeles, CA, 1981

EDUCATION

The Fletcher School of Law & Diplomacy, Tufts University **Medford, MA**
PhD in International Relations **2008-Present**
Master of Arts in Law & Diplomacy **May 2008**
Fields of study: International Security Studies, and Public International Law
Doctoral Committee: Robert L. Pfaltzgraff, Jr. (Chair), Richard Shultz, William C. Martel
Dissertation title: *Targeting Armed Violence: Implications of Localized Efforts to Control Small Arms Proliferation and Misuse in the Former Yugoslavia*

Occidental College **Los Angeles, CA**
Bachelor of Arts, Double Major in Diplomacy & World Affairs, and Spanish **May 2003**
Summa cum Laude, Phi Beta Kappa (Junior inductee)
Occidental-at-the-United-Nations, New York, NY, Fall 2001
Study Abroad, Universidad Iberoamericana, Mexico City, Spring 2002

EMPLOYMENT

US Government Accountability Office, International Affairs and Trade (IAT) **Washington, DC**
Intern **May-August 2007**
Assigned to an engagement studying United Nations (UN) management reforms. Attended and participated in meetings with U.S. government, United Nations, and other officials in Washington, D.C. and New York. Prepared interview questions and records of interviews. Developed a matrix of member delegations' opinions on the primary challenges to UN management reform. Took a lead role in reviewing ethics reform and writing the corresponding section of the report. Developed a timeline showing progress of UN reform activities. Assisted in the preparation of a Senate testimony on U.S. employment in the United Nations. Also participated in the IAT Brown Bags forum and presented a discussion on "Weapons of Individual Destruction: Understanding the Threat of Small Arms Proliferation" to IAT staff.

CACI, Yucca Mountain Project **Rosslyn, VA**
Document Management Analyst **March 2005-July 2006**
Reviewed and evaluated documents for privacy and security considerations for inclusion in the Yucca Mountain Project Licensing Support Network (LSN) in support of the Department of Energy's upcoming license application to the Nuclear Regulatory Commission. Managed and maintained MS Access database tracking LSN document status.

Center for Defense Information **Washington, DC**
Research Assistant **September 2004-December 2004**
Provided research assistance for Challenging Conventional Threats project, focusing on small arms, the conventional arms trade, and child soldiers. Authored issue briefs for CDI website on U.S. arms transfers and military assistance to Algeria, Georgia, Indonesia, and the Philippines, and on U.S. landmines policy.

Federation of American Scientists, Strategic Security Project

Washington, DC

Scoville Fellow /Research Assistant

September 2003-August 2004

Provided research assistance for Arms Sales Monitoring Project. Conducted research on U.S. Policy and the Missile Technology Control Regime (MTCR). Wrote issue briefs on topics including MANPADS Proliferation and the OAS Firearms Convention. Attended the XVIII General Conference of OPANAL (Agency for the Prohibition of Nuclear Weapons in Latin America and the Caribbean) in Havana, Cuba as an NGO Observer. Participated in Arms Transfer Working Group (ATWG) meetings. Updated FAS website content.

United Nations Department for Disarmament Affairs

New York, NY

Intern

Fall 2001

Prepared summaries of portions of the Special Session on Terrorism, the General Debate, and the First Committee (disarmament and international security). Prepared charts and analysis comparing resolutions and voting patterns with previous Sessions. Contributed to documents on the Barcelona Process and the Anti-Personnel Landmines Ban (Ottawa Convention).

UNPUBLISHED RESEARCH

“Weapons of Individual Destruction: Understanding and Addressing the Small Arms Threat,” MALD Thesis, Spring 2008.

“Small Arms, Massive Destruction: An examination of the significance of small arms disarmament, focusing on Nicaragua and El Salvador,” Diplomacy and World Affairs Senior Thesis, Spring 2003.

“Breaking the Silence: The Mexican novel as alternative history and political discourse focusing on the presidential term of Luis Echeverría,” (written in Spanish), Spanish Senior Thesis, Spring 2003.

PUBLICATIONS

US Government Accountability Office. “United Nations: Progress on Management Reform Efforts Has Varied,” GAO-08-84, November 2007. Contributing Analyst.

Center for Defense Information. "U.S. Arms Exports and Military Assistance in the 'Global War on Terror,'" CDI, September 2007. Contributing Author. Available from <http://www.cdi.org/PDFs/Export Trends Full.pdf>.

US Government Accountability Office. “United Nations Organizations: Enhanced Efforts Needed to Increase U.S. Employment at UN Agencies: Statement of Thomas Melito, Director, International Affairs and Trade,” GAO-07-1152T, August 1, 2007. Contributing Analyst.

Chankin-Gould, Sarah and Dr. Ivan Oelrich. “Double-Edged Shield,” *Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists*, Vol. 61, No. 3 (May/June 2005): 36-41.

Chankin-Gould, Sarah. "Preventing Nuclear Proliferation in Latin America: The Treaty of Tlatelolco," *FAS Public Interest Report*, Vol. 57, No. 1 (Winter 2004): 22-24. Available from www.fas.org/faspir/2004/v57n1/tlatelolco.htm.

Chankin-Gould, Sarah. "The Israeli Female Soldier: An Analysis of the Role of Women in the Israeli Defense Force and the Implications for Israeli Society," *Perspectives Journal*, Occidental College, (Fall 2002): 6-17.

PRESENTATIONS

Chankin-Gould, Sarah. "Targeting Armed Violence: An Overview of International Small Arms Aid in the Former Yugoslavia." Paper presented at International Studies Association Annual Convention, San Diego, CA (April 2012).

HONORS AND AWARDS

International Security Studies Program, Scholarship for conducting research abroad, 2011
International Security Studies Program, Bradley Foundation Fellow, 2008-2010
Scoville Peace Fellow, 2003-2004
Phi Beta Kappa Benjamin Culley Prize winner, May 2003
Roger P. Withrow Award recipient, Diplomacy and World Affairs Department, May 2003
Phi Beta Kappa, Junior Inductee, Fall 2002
National Security Education Program (NSEP) David L. Boren Scholar, 2001-2002
National Merit Scholar, 1999-2003

LANGUAGES

Spanish, Advanced Professional Proficiency

PROFESSIONAL AFFILIATIONS

American Political Science Association (APSA)
International Studies Association (ISA)
Women in International Security (WIIS)

ABSTRACT

Small arms and light weapons are ubiquitous weapons of war. Their influence is felt daily around the world and they have increasingly garnered international attention. Concurrent with efforts to develop broad-based international regimes, a bottom-up approach has emerged that is focused on localized armed violence reduction through the means of addressing a myriad of small arms problems (e.g., DDR, civilian weapons collection and destruction, stockpile management, legislative reform and enforcement, and public education).

This dissertation explores the role and effectiveness of these localized aid efforts by examining the following underlying questions: How can we evaluate success of small arms aid? What are the geographically limited initiatives trying to address? Are they succeeding? Are they sufficient? And how are they affected by the SALW policy environment?

My research begins by examining the extent to which an international regime on small arms has and has not developed since the 2001 UN Programme of Action. It then engages in focused case studies of international assistance programs run by UNDP that are addressing localized small arms problems in the former Yugoslavia—in Bosnia and Herzegovina, Croatia, and Kosovo.

In assessing the cases, I develop a framework of criteria to evaluate effectiveness, including: the extent to which a robust policy and legal framework has been developed; the

extent to which the other proximate goals of the program have been achieved; the extent to which local capacity has been developed (the sustainability of the intervention); the extent to which the broader societal context has changed concurrent with the intervention; and the extent to which security and perceptions of security have changed.

I find that these localized small arms control efforts are engaging in important work, and are profoundly influenced by the broader policy environment. In fact, the programs are helping to bring local laws and policies in line with European and international regimes on SALW. These broader regimes lack an enforcement mechanism, yet they are being actualized, at least in the former Yugoslavia, via targeted international aid. I conclude with a series of recommendations for policy and future research.

DEDICATION

In memory of George L. Sherry, envoy, teacher, and mentor.

For believing in an ambitious young student and pushing me to be my best self.

And for introducing me to UN DDA and thus down the road to this very study.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

First of all, thank you to my interviewees for contributing your time and your thoughts. Your perspective and experience enriched the quality of my research and narrative, and your enthusiasm for the topic heartened me in pursuing this work.

Thank you to my Fletcher professors and committee members for their support and guidance over the years—Professors Pfaltzgraff, Shultz, and Martel. In particular, thank you to my advisor and chair, Professor Pfaltzgraff, who has been my academic advisor since I began my MALD thesis, and who has encouraged my work and consistently provided discerning feedback. Thank you also to Professor Ed Laurance of the Monterey Institute of International Studies (MIIS), whose expertise and insight early in the process helped shape my prospectus and approach to this research, and whose support opened doors.

Thank you also my Oxy professors—Professors Caldwell, Jaquette, and Fernandez—for your teaching, encouragement, mentorship, and friendship. I could not ask for a better college experience than the one you gave me. You taught me to be a better thinker and writer, and encouraged me in my aspirations big and small.

Thank you to my friends and colleagues for standing by my side throughout this process. Thank you to Ines Kapphan, Irina Chindea, and Anna Schulz, who started this process by my side. Thank you to Marina Travayiakis for being my cheerleader during the final stages. Thank you also to my friend and intrepid editor Katie Light Soloway—I can't

imagine going through this process without you. I am fortunate to have such a group of strong scholarly women supporting me. And to my many other friends who have supported me throughout the process—my gratitude is profound.

Lastly, I owe my deepest thanks to my family. Thank you to my husband who has been by my side throughout this arduous process, and has kept me sane and provided perspective. Thank you to my family of origin—to my parents, siblings, and grandparents—who have always believed in me and encouraged me. An especial thanks to my mother, who asked that critical question of my 16 year old self which ultimately illuminated my path of study and chosen career—a variation on the timeless question, “What would you do, if you knew you could not fail?” Thank you also, for all the years of effort in helping me learn to make the best of my abilities and my shortcomings, and for many years of thankless editing. Finally, thank you to my Bubby who once told me she could die secure in the knowledge that I would be the first PhD in the family—I am so happy that you are here to rejoice in this moment. I only wish that my beloved Bernie and Grandpa could be here too. I know how proud they would be. To all my family, you have been my cheering section and my constant support. I am so lucky to have you.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABBREVIATIONS.....	xiv
1 INTRODUCTION.....	1
Background	1
Defining the Terms.....	4
Significance of the Project.....	7
Problem Statement / Research Question.....	10
Thesis	11
Methodology.....	12
Overview and Data Collection.....	12
Evaluating the Cases	14
Case Selection	16
Conclusion	22
2 LITERATURE REVIEW.....	24
Introduction	24
The Changing Nature of War and the 21st Century Conflict Paradigm	25
Traditional understandings of the nature of war	25
New wars and new concepts	27
Why it Matters	36
Proliferation and Arms Control.....	36
Cold War - Deterrence, Non-proliferation and Arms Control.....	37
Post Cold War–Rethinking Deterrence and Shifting Priorities.....	39
Why it Matters	44
Development Literature	46
Overview.....	46
Understanding UNDP, the Actor	46
Development Aid: The Big Picture.....	47
Aid Effectiveness	53
Development, Peace and Security.....	55
Evaluating Aid.....	59
Why it Matters	62
Small Arms Literature.....	63
Overview.....	63
Proliferation and Misuse.....	65
Legal Implications	67
Human Security	70
Armed Violence Framework.....	72

	Analyzing Aid	75
	Why it Matters	81
3	INTERNATIONAL AND REGIONAL REGIMES ON SMALL ARMS AND LIGHT WEAPONS ..	82
	Context.....	82
	US Policy.....	85
	International Regimes.....	97
	The Vienna Firearms Protocol.....	98
	Conference on the Illicit Trade in Small Arms and Light Weapons in All Its Aspects ...	102
	The UN Conventional Arms Register	113
	Wassenaar Arrangement.....	115
	International Tracing Instrument.....	118
	Arms Trade Treaty	121
	International Small Arms Control Standards	125
	Role of the UN Security Council	127
	International Initiatives - Beyond Proliferation	129
	Regional Regimes and Initiatives - Small Arms in the European Context	130
	European Union	130
	Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe.....	135
	North Atlantic Treaty Organization	137
	Stability Pact / Regional Co-operation Council.....	139
	Beyond the Stability Pact: RACVIAC, SEESAC, and RASR.....	142
	Conclusions	147
4	SMALL ARMS CONTROL IN BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA: A CASE STUDY	148
	Introduction	148
	Socio-Political Background of Bosnia and Herzegovina.....	151
	Background on Small Arms in Bosnia and Herzegovina	157
	SACBiH Program Design and Objectives	165
	Developing a Legal and Policy Framework on Small Arms in Bosnia and Herzegovina.	169
	Other SACBiH Accomplishments and Challenges - Addressing Program Goals	174
	Component 1: Enhanced Institutional Capacity for SALW Control	174
	Component 2: SALW and Associated Systems Destruction	181
	Component 3: Ammunition Disposal.....	182
	Successes and Challenges: A Practitioner's Perspective	187
	Small Arms in Bosnia and Herzegovina after SACBiH	189
	SACBiH in a Changing Context.....	192
	Changes in Economic and Human Development	192
	Changes in Civil Society and the International Aid Context.....	194
	Changing Perceptions of Security.....	198
	Conclusions	203

5	SMALL ARMS CONTROL IN CROATIA: A CASE STUDY	210
	Introduction	210
	Socio-Political Background of Croatia	213
	Background on Small Arms in Croatia.....	216
	Arms Control, Violence Prevention and Community Security in Croatia: Program Design and Objectives	223
	Developing a Legal and Policy Framework on Small Arms in Croatia	226
	Other Accomplishments and Challenges of the Croatia Small Arms Program – Addressing Program Goals	230
	Output 1: Community Policing.....	230
	Output 2: Safer Community Plans.....	232
	Output 3: Firearms and violence	236
	Successes and Challenges: A Practitioner’s Perspective	240
	Croatia Small Arms Programming in a Changing Context.....	244
	Changes in Economic and Human Development	245
	Changes in Civil Society and the International Aid Context.....	247
	Changing Perceptions of Security.....	250
	Conclusions	253
6	SMALL ARMS CONTROL IN KOSOVO: A CASE STUDY.....	259
	Introduction	259
	Socio-Political Background of Kosovo	262
	Background on Small Arms in Kosovo.....	266
	KOSSAC Program Design and Objectives	275
	Developing a Legal and Policy Framework on Small Arms in Kosovo	279
	Other KOSSAC Accomplishments and Challenges – Addressing Program Goals	286
	Output 1: Implementation of SALW Strategy and Action Plan.....	286
	Output 2: Capacity Building.....	289
	Output 3: Safer Community Development.....	290
	Output 4: Gender-Sensitive SALW Programming.....	292
	Successes and Challenges: A Practitioner’s Perspective	294
	KOSSAC in a Changing Context.....	295
	Changes in Economic and Human Development	295
	Changes in Civil Society and the International Aid Context.....	298
	Changing Perceptions of Security.....	301
	Conclusions	305
7	CROSS-CASE ANALYSIS: COMPARING SMALL ARMS CONTROL EFFORTS IN BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA, CROATIA, AND KOSOVO.....	313
	Introduction	313
	Developing a Legal and Policy Framework on Small Arms.....	314
	Addressing other program goals	316

Stockpile security/reduction	316
Collection programs.....	317
Safer Community Programs.....	318
Capacity Building.....	320
SALW Control in a Dynamic Environment.....	321
Changes in Socio-Political Context	322
Changes in Security and Perceptions of Security	325
Regional SALW Control Efforts from a Practitioner’s Perspective.....	327
Conclusions	329
8 CONCLUSION	334
Overview.....	334
Findings.....	337
Policy Recommendations.....	342
Developing a Legal and Policy Framework on Small Arms	343
Addressing other Program Goals.....	343
Small Arms in a Changing Socio-Political Context.....	345
Security and Perceptions of Security.....	346
Application of Regional and International Regimes on SALW	347
Program Evaluation.....	347
Funding	347
Research Recommendations	348
Closing	350
BIBLIOGRAPHY	351

ABBREVIATIONS

ATT	Arms Trade Treaty
AVR	Armed Violence Reduction
BCPR	UNDP's Bureau for Conflict Prevention and Recovery
BMS	Biennial Meeting of States
BiH	Bosnia and Herzegovina
CASA	UN Coordinating Action on Small Arms
CSO	Civil Society Organization
DDR	Disarmament, Demobilization, and Reintegration
DTRA	US Defense Threat Reduction Agency
DfD	Destruction for Development
EUSAC	EU Small Arms Control pilot projects
EXPLODE	Explosive Ordnance and Remnants of War Destruction
FRY	Federal Republic of Yugoslavia (1992-2003, comprised of Serbia and Montenegro)
FYROM	Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia
HDI	Human Development Index
HDR	Human Development Report
ISAC	International Small Arms Control program (in Kosovo)
ISACS	International Small Arms Control Standards

KFOR	NATO's Kosovo Force
KLA	Kosovo Liberation Army (UÇK)
KOSSAC	Kosovo Small Arms Control Initiative
MANPADS	Man-Portable Air Defense Systems
MDG	Millennium Development Goals
MoD	Ministry of Defense
MoI	Ministry of Interior
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
ODA	Official Development Assistance
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OHR	Office of the High Representative in Bosnia and Herzegovina
OSCE	Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe
PM/WRA	US Department of State's Bureau of Political-Military Affairs, Office of Weapons Removal and Abatement
PfP	NATO's Partnership for Peace
PoA	UN Programme of Action
RACVIAC	Regional Arms Control Verification and Implementation Assistance Centre –Centre for Security Cooperation
RASR	Regional Approach to Stockpile Reduction
RS	Republika Srpska

SACBiH	Small Arms Control Programme in Bosnia and Herzegovina
SALW	Small Arms and Light Weapons
SEESAC	South Eastern and Eastern Europe Clearinghouse for the Control of the Small Arms and Light Weapons
SFOR	NATO's Stabilization Force (in Bosnia and Herzegovina)
SFRY	Socialist Federal Republic of Yugoslavia ("The Former Yugoslavia")
SSR	Security Sector Reform
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNIDIR	United Nations Institute for Disarmament Research
UNMIK	United Nations Interim Administration in Kosovo
UNODC	United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime
UNPROFOR	United Nations Protection Force (in the Former Yugoslavia)
UNTAES	United Nations Transitional Administration in Eastern Slavonia, Baranja and Western Sirmium