

The Creation and Sale of the Modern Italian Nationalist Myth to the British:  
Photographs of Florence by the Fratelli Alinari between 1865 and 1871

An Honors Thesis for the Department of Art History

Sarah G. Miller

Tufts University, 2009

## **Table of Contents**

Introduction.....	page 2
Chapter 1: Palazzo del Bargello .....	page 12
Chapter 2: The Duomo.....	page 27
Chapter 3: The Uffizi.....	page 43
Conclusion.....	page 55
Appendix 1: Images.....	page 63
Appendix 2: References.....	page 64

## Introduction

The Fratelli Alinari photographed the Medieval and Renaissance architecture in Florence because they wanted to create a nationalist myth to sell to the British. They tried to answer positively the question, can art change politics and perception? When Florence became the capital of Italy in 1865, it needed to convince English tourists that it could function as the symbol for Italy as a unified country. Florence sought to demonstrate that it held the necessary characteristics of a modern capital city. The photographs of the Palazzo del Bargello, the Duomo and the Uffizi focused on the three most important aspects of Italian society. The Palazzo del Bargello was a testament to the Italian ability to effectively govern, specifically the patricians who were not the nobility but wealthy guild members. The Duomo refuted the British belief that Protestantism was a more advanced religion than Catholicism. If the British believed that their religion was superior, then so was their culture and society. The photograph of the Duomo maintained that Italy's society, both during the Renaissance and in the 1860s was neither decadent nor primitive. Finally, the photograph of the Uffizi demonstrated Italy's ability to integrate art and nationalism.

In 1865, the capital of Italy moved from Turin, which had been Italy's capital since its unification five years before, to Florence, a tourist's city, known more for its art than for its politics. Italy was in the final years of the Risorgimento, Italy's war for independence and unification. In 1870, Rome would also become a part of the newly formed Kingdom of Italy and in 1871 the capital would finally move there, officially ending almost 60 years of social, political and military upheaval.<sup>1</sup> However, for those five years in which Florence was the capital of Italy, the city wanted to prove itself as a capital city, a symbol of the Italian nation state.

---

<sup>1</sup> Arthur James Beresford Whyte. *The Evolution of Modern Italy*. (New York: Norton, 1965). 180.

Florence had devolved from a powerful tastemaker into a city populated by tourists by the 18<sup>th</sup> century. By the 19<sup>th</sup> century, the images of the city had to support it as both a travel destination and as a viable capital of a Western European country.<sup>2</sup> As Cavilino described, “Guardatevi del dir loro che...le vecchie cartoline non rappresentano Maurilia com’era, ma un’altra città per caso si chiamato Maurilia come questa.”<sup>3</sup> This quote roughly translated to “the old postcards do not represent Maurilia as it was, but another city, also called Maurilia.” Therefore, the Florence of which the Alinari took pictures, was not necessarily the Florence that actually existed, but the Florence that they wanted to exist; the one that they wanted to be remembered and brought back to the tourists’ home countries. This meant that they took pictures of Florence that supported their idea of how Florence should look; they chose not to photograph the parts of the city that did not conform to the idealized version of Florence that they wanted to disseminate. For example, there were few instances of modern buildings in their photographs. In addition, it was these images that would dictate how people would imagine Florence. If someone had never been to Florence but saw an Alinari photograph instead, they would imagine a city that was consistent with the provided images.

The Alinari established their firm during the second half of the Risorgimento. The Alinari firm was launched by the middle brother, Leopoldo (1832-1865). He was apprenticed to the chalcographer, Luigi Bardi in Florence, who printed etchings to be sold to tourists. During his apprenticeship as a teenager, Alinari discovered the uses of photography as a means of creating compositions that could be turned into etchings. Eventually, the photographs were sold as images in their own right. His work was first shown in the book L’Italie Monumentale,

---

<sup>2</sup>Michele Falzone del Barbarò, Monica Maffioli, and Emanuela Sesti.. *Alle Origini della Fotografia : Un Itinerario Toscano, 1839-1880*. (Firenze: Alinari, 1989). 4.

<sup>3</sup> Falzone del Barbaró 4.

exhibited in Paris in 1851.<sup>4</sup> By 1852 he was joined by his two brothers, the older, Romualdo, who had apprenticed in a bank and took care of the administration of the firm while the younger, and Giuseppe became involved in experimenting with the chemistry of photography.<sup>5</sup> Although they established their firm in the same year, they were still working in collaboration with the more well-established Bardi, since many of their early photographs included the blindstamp “Fratelli Alinari/ Fotografi/ Firenze/ presso Luigi Bardi.”<sup>6</sup> Originally, these images were sold to those tourists who were participating in the Grand Tour.<sup>7</sup>

During the late 1850s and early 1860s, the Alinari became famous for their representations of Tuscan Renaissance artwork. By 1855 the Alinari had received international acclaim at the Paris Exposition of the same year, where they showed photographs representing over forty-seven separate pieces of artwork, including the bronze doors of the Florentine Baptistery.<sup>8</sup> It was also in Paris that the Alinari began to establish relationships with other photographers working throughout Europe.<sup>9</sup> Following their success in Paris, in 1858 the Alinari were commissioned by Prince Albert of England to take photographs of Raphael’s work in the Gallerie dell’Accademia in Venice, the Uffizi in Florence and the Kunsthistorische Museum in Vienna.<sup>10</sup> He kept the photographs in his personal collection; they allowed him to look at the paintings without having to travel to their original location. By 1860, the Alinari had solved the major issues involved with photographing works of art, which prepared them for documenting the major works of the Uffizi in 1861.

---

<sup>4</sup> Arturo Carlo Quintavalle and Monica Maffioli. *Fratelli Alinari Fotografi in Firenze: 150 Anni che Illustrarono il Mondo: 1852-2002*. (Firenze: Fratelli Alinari, 2003). 21

<sup>5</sup> Falzone del Barbarò, 21. ; Susanna Weber, and Ferruccio Malandrini. *Fratelli Alinari in Florence. History of Photography* 20, (Spring 1996): 49-56. 49.; Wladimiro Settimelli, and Filippo Zevi. *Gli Alinari Fotografi a Firenze, 1852-1920*. (Firenze: Alinari, 1977). 27

<sup>6</sup> Weber, 51.

<sup>7</sup> Quintavalle, 23.

<sup>8</sup> Quintavalle, 49.

<sup>9</sup> Settimelli 27.

<sup>10</sup> Quintavalle, 30.

In 1863 the Alinari moved to via Nazionale 8 during which time the Alinari also began to offer new types of photographs. In addition to large views, they also introduced more tourist-friendly formats, for example the “carte di vista” which were the precursor to the modern postcard and stereoscopes which were two images that when viewed through a specific instrument allowed for the image to appear to be three dimensional.<sup>11</sup> In addition, by June of that year, they were offering natural landscapes in addition to the cityscapes of Florence and the surrounding Tuscan cities, such as Pisa.<sup>12</sup>

The year 1865 was momentous for the Alinari since it not only signaled the move of the capital city to Florence, but also the death of its founding member, Leopoldo.<sup>13</sup> At this point, the remaining two brothers, Romualdo and Giuseppe, continued working on administration and technical aspects, respectively, and they hired photographers to take the actual photographs, who followed in the style previously established by Leopoldo. It was also during this period that the Alinari firm began to document the façade of Santa Maria del Fiore, the Florentine Cathedral, including its restoration. As Florence adapted to its new role, the Alinari began to follow the subsequent urbanization of Florence.

It was important to the Alinari that photography was primarily seen as a form of science and not necessarily an artistic endeavor because an object scientific approach made their claims seem more convincing. The belief that photography fell under the realm of science, not art, was especially true during the beginnings of the 1800s Industrial Revolution. After information regarding the Daguerreotype in 1839 became well known outside of France, professors in universities throughout Italy began to try to replicate the process. By November of that same year, the Italians attempted to repeat the experiment throughout the peninsula, from Bologna to

---

<sup>11</sup> Quintavalle, 34.

<sup>12</sup> Quintavalle, 35.

<sup>13</sup> Quintavalle, 35.

Naples.<sup>14</sup> The men doing the experiments were scientists who viewed this discovery as a scientific breakthrough. For example, Dr. Zantedeschi of Padua and Tito Puliti of Florence were science professors working to improve the camera in order to aid in their experiments.<sup>15</sup> There were, however, other trends that led photography as a new artform, or at least as a threat to painting. Specifically, it was Paul Delaroche, who reported on the announcement and subsequent demonstration of the daguerreotype in Paris in 1839, who proclaimed that, “from today, painting is dead!”<sup>16</sup> Also, with the publication of William Henry Fox Talbot’s work, entitled “The Pencil of Nature” in 1841, there was an obvious allusion to photography as a form of artwork as well as creating a template upon which photography was to be presented and viewed.<sup>17</sup> In addition, Talbot’s photographs, such as The Open Door of 1843, with a conscious reference to Dutch painting’s formal structure, were self-consciously constructed it to be viewed as “Art.”<sup>18</sup>

The photographic style in Europe quickly shifted, allowing for more Romantic “picturesque” views which continued the trend of associating photography with “High Art.” At that time, “High Art” was art destined to “instruct, purify and enhance” and had an “emphasis on edifying scenes.”<sup>19</sup> In addition, there were photographers like David Octavius Hill and Robert Adamson, both Scottish, who embraced the grainy quality of the calotypes as opposed to the incredible detail and distinctness of the daguerreotype.<sup>20</sup> Although the calotype soon gave way to the ambrotype and other technologies that allowed for both the positive-negative process of the calotype and the clarity afforded by the daguerreotype. These new technologies also had

---

<sup>14</sup> Italo Zannier. *Storia della Fotografia Italiana*. (Grandi opere. Roma: Laterza, 1986). 6

<sup>15</sup> Zannier, 8.

<sup>16</sup> Helmut Gernsheim, Alison Gernsheim, and Joint Author.. *A Concise History of Photography*. (New York: Grosset & Dunlap, 1965). 23

<sup>17</sup> T. J. Clark. 2006. In a pomegranate chandelier. *The London Review of Book*.41

<sup>18</sup> Clark, 42.

<sup>19</sup> Mary Warner Marien. *Photography : A Cultural History*. (Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson Prentice Hall, 2006). 90.

<sup>20</sup> Gernsheim, 82-5.

faster processes. Although there was still a distinct move towards pictorialism or a more romantic style that many photographers believed to be more indicative of Art, the Alinari seemed to thwart the association with High Art in order to portray a more believable reality.<sup>21</sup>

Baudelaire did not believe that photography was “High Art,” as his testimony in the Salon of 1859 shows; instead he saw photography as the Triumph of Truth over Beauty.<sup>22</sup> He saw photography not as an art form, but as a science. Baudelaire argued that, “The exclusive taste for the True (so noble a thing when limited to its proper applications) oppresses and stifles the taste for the Beautiful.”<sup>23</sup> He explained, that earlier forms of artwork, specifically mediums such as painting or sculpture, which were entirely dependent on the artist’s hand as well as a series of choices the artists made, meant that truth could be forgiven in order to increase beauty. In his view, truth should be relegated to the focus of “philosophers, perhaps, moralists, engineers, connoisseurs of instructive anecdotes, whatever you like, but never spontaneously artist.”<sup>24</sup> Therefore, what is considered to be truth does not automatically mean that it is beautiful.

The firm of the Fratelli Alinari photographed in a flat, scientific style in order to show the Bargello, the Duomo and the Uffizi as an iconography that would make Italy seem like a great and powerful country. Florence became indicative of Italy as a whole, because as the capital, it had become its symbol. The Bargello shows Florence as a city that used to have a republican past that was managed by the wealthy merchants and bankers. After centuries in which Italy was controlled by either the clergy or domestic and international nobility, it was important to show that the contemporary Italian bourgeoisie were capable of governing themselves. Also, as an image of power, the Bargello, a fortress, showed that the Florentines

---

<sup>21</sup> Quintavalle, 24.

<sup>22</sup> Charles Baudelaire, and Jonathan Mayne. *Art in Paris, 1845-1862 : Salons and Other Exhibitions*. (Landmarks in art history; cornell paperbacks. Ithaca, N.Y: Cornell University Press, 1981). 151.

<sup>23</sup> Baudelaire, 151

<sup>24</sup> Baudelaire, 152



were able to defend their city. Florence needed to prove that it was also a military might since it was Turin and the Piedmontese army that actually fought the Austrians.

Florence was not an unknown city; England had been using it as a resort town since the 16<sup>th</sup> century.<sup>25</sup> Italy had become a theme park of the past where the British elite could travel for pleasure and education. They referred to this trip as the Grand Tour, and while it sometimes included other countries in Continental Europe, Italy was the favored destination. Italy had the added benefit of a warm climate and art and architecture, ranging from Classical antiquities to Medieval and Renaissance works.<sup>26</sup> Thus, the Italians only added to the general ambiance; whatever issues or problems they might have been experiencing at the time did not take hold of the British consciousness. Yet, contemporaneously, the newly unified Italy desperately needed the British to see Italy as a cohesive nation-state because England was the most powerful country in Europe at the time; if England recognized Italy as a nation-state, then the rest of the Europe would follow suit.

The Grand Tour became popular between the years 1706 and 1739; peaceful years for both Italy and England.<sup>27</sup> France was sometimes also included on the Tour. However, while Paris represented the leading European court as the center of civil, polite society and the arts, it was also intermittently at war with England, complicating travel.<sup>28</sup> Thus, Italy became the preeminent destination for British tourists. Italy's popularity grew as the Cult of Antiquity, an aesthetic which looked to classical Greco-Roman architecture, gained in prominence as well.<sup>29</sup> Although Renaissance artwork eventually became one of the prime reasons to travel to Italy during the nineteenth century, in the eighteenth century, it was classical culture that brought the

---

<sup>25</sup> Jeremy Black. *Italy and the Grand Tour*. (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2003). 2.

<sup>26</sup> Black, 4.

<sup>27</sup> Black, 2.

<sup>28</sup> Black, 2.

<sup>29</sup> Black, 2

tourists.<sup>30</sup> However, by the time that the Alinari began working, around 1860, the Renaissance was once again in vogue.

British travelers began in the north, after crossing over the French Alps, and moved south. However, these routes could change depending on the time of year, the weather and whatever religious holidays were occurring at that time.<sup>31</sup> Normally, their point of entry into Italy ranged from Turin and Genoa in the northeast to Milan in the center or to Venice in the northwest.<sup>32</sup> Turin was popular as an entry point because the Dukes of Savoy were pro-British. Milan was also a major attraction because it had the Hapsburg Opera house. Venice and Genoa were also popular.<sup>33</sup>

Florence was always an important stop on the Tour because it was home to the Uffizi and the most socially active British transplants. However, it lost some appeal during the eighteenth century because it did not have great classical ruins. Instead, Rome became more popular because it was home to many examples of classical art and architecture and, thus, became the final destination for many travelers.<sup>34</sup> However, Rome was less exciting than Florence because its court was the Vatican which did not provide the mostly Protestant British with many points of access.<sup>35</sup> It was also often noted that Rome was too hot in the summer. Naples offered travelers the means of reaching famous classical ruins, such as Pompeii, but it was viewed as being too rough a city.<sup>36</sup> It was Sicily, however, that was the site of some of the greatest classical works in Italy, but the British thought that it was too far away.<sup>37</sup> Yet, despite the complaints about the

---

<sup>30</sup> Black, 3.

<sup>31</sup> Black, 36

<sup>32</sup> Black, 23.

<sup>33</sup> Black, 37

<sup>34</sup> Black, 46

<sup>35</sup> Black, 50

<sup>36</sup> Black, 50, 54.

<sup>37</sup> Black, 56, 60.

other cities, Florence only began to gain prominence as a culturally relevant city during the nineteenth century with the resurgence of interest in Renaissance art.

In order to be considered a nation-state, a nation must exhibit certain characteristics. These characteristics are still highly debatable yet almost all scholars agree that the citizens of a nation-state must feel a fundamental connection to each other that does not extend to citizens of other countries.<sup>38</sup> The connection between the citizens stems from the belief that their country is somehow superior. The British, one of the originators of this form of nationalism, strongly believed that their superiority was due to their political and industrial advancements.<sup>39</sup> In consequence, Britain needed to see that there was an aspect of Italy's past of which all Italians were proud.

Historically, Italy had been a group of completely separate and independent regions, with little connection to each other.<sup>40</sup> Each region operated completely autonomously of the others, and while proximity led to trade and the sharing of ideas, it also occasionally led to war and fierce competition. Thus, the history of each of the regions became independent, and while regions close to one another might have overlapping pasts, those with greater distances between them would not have anything in common. Italians in Venice, for example, would not feel as though Sicily's history was related to their own. Therefore, while the Italians might feel intensely proud of their own region's history, it would not extend to the entire country. Italy's social and political system declined after the 16<sup>th</sup> century. After the Renaissance, Italy was controlled by Austria, Spain, the Catholic Church and even France; in no instance was an Italian state governed by Italians.<sup>41</sup> Even the regions that had been republics during the Renaissance, such as Venice and Florence, became subjects under the Austrian Empire. The

---

<sup>38</sup> Jack L. Snyder. *From Voting to Violence : Democratization and Nationalist Conflict*. (1st ed. New York: Norton, 2000). 23

<sup>39</sup> Snyder, 45.

<sup>40</sup> Whyte, 2.

<sup>41</sup> Whyte, 2.

Risorgimento did not happen cleanly nor was it without problems because very little of the population was very interested in the endeavor.<sup>42</sup> The original intent of the Risorgimento was independence and was supposed to be achieved without unification. Yet, in order to achieve this goal, the Risorgimento leaders needed to both unify and engage England as an ally.<sup>43</sup> Although England did not contribute troops due to its power and geographic position, it functioned as a supporter.

The Duomo demonstrated that Italy's Catholicism had not created a society that was undone by its decadence and primitivism. Thus, the photograph of the Duomo the Renaissance could not have been so decadent or so irresponsible because during that period, great, long-standing structures were created. The Duomo was incredible because it was still the largest brick dome ever built at that time. The Renaissance and the Italians were not primitive or irresponsible because it took great technical ingenuity to build such a structure. It also showed the great achievements of the middle class and proved to the British that the Renaissance was actually a period of a functioning political system.

The Uffizi attested to Italy's relationship with art. The Alinari were trying to market a particular view of Italy as a country that was surrounded by beauty. In addition, this beauty was entirely interwoven with the culture and its citizens, even in the countryside which was dominated by vineyards and olive trees. They tried to show that the natural beauty of Italy melded with Italian High Art. In order to communicate with the British, the Alinari had to show Italian nationalism in British terms and concepts. The British understood that in order to have a nation-state, the country also had to have a sense of nationalism. Thus, in order to convince the British, a people who felt consistently superior to the Italians, that Italy was a nation to be taken seriously, the Alinari had to show that the Italians were in fact superior to the British.

---

<sup>42</sup> Whyte, 7.

<sup>43</sup> Whyte, 91.

## **Chapter 1: The Palazzo del Bargello**

### My Argument:

My argument is that the problem with England taking Italy's new government seriously was four-fold. First, Italy had been controlled by outside forces and the Catholic Church for the centuries between the Renaissance and the Risorgimento. Thus, the British Victorians believed that the important aspects of Italy's political and economic history ended with the Renaissance. Second, the government originated in Turin, not Florence, and it was Turin that was responsible for the majority of the fighting against Austria, which meant that Florence had to establish itself as an important political and military city as well. Although Tuscany was granted its own Parliament, it was Turin's parliament that moved south to Florence with the rest of the government. In addition, Florence was not supposed to be the capital; the Italian government wanted the French-occupied Rome. Third, the Risorgimento, Italy's fight for independence against Austrian rule, was orchestrated by the intellectual elite. The lower class did not care about Italy's new government. Fourth, England's ingrained sense of nationalism meant that it was obligated to believe that Italy was incapable of self-rule.

The Alinari addressed these issues in the photograph of the Palazzo del Bargello, a medieval fortress and statehouse. The photograph demonstrated Florence's ability to be governed by the patricians, high-ranking merchants during the Middle Ages. The Alinari photograph caused the viewer to confront and engage with the image; it at once had an incredible amount of detail which drew the viewer's gaze, while the actual composition repelled the gaze. The tension between the viewer's desire to delve into the image and the Bargello's refutation of the gaze resulted in the viewer really looking at the image as more than simply an important monument in Florence but as a historically important building in its own right.

## Intro

As Italy began slowly and haltingly to progress towards a more cohesive and modern form of government, England had already created a stable nationalist identity. Throughout the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, the British were a consistent presence in Italy with the establishment of informal English colonies in Florence, Naples and Rome.<sup>44</sup> Those wealthy enough to travel participated in the Grand Tour which was an extended journey to continental Europe for both education and pleasure. It was mostly frequented by the sons of Britain's elite; however, women and families also participated. Because Italy was well known for its art and natural beauty, it became a prime destination on the Tour. In some cases, the travelers chose to stay and live in Italy full time, resulting in British outcroppings in the major Italian cities. Therefore, England would have been well-aware of the events taking place in Italy during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries.

Due to the popularity of the Grand Tour, Florence was already well known to foreigners prior to becoming the capital. As travel became institutionalized in the eighteenth century, the city of Florence was distilled to a series of sites by the British tourists through the use of guidebooks, which had become popular at that time. Because the tourists turned the city into a series of sites that all visitors were obligated to see, certain artwork or monuments became symbols of the city, regardless of their original political association.<sup>45</sup> For example, a picture of the Duomo or Sandro Botticelli's Birth of Venus became a symbol of the city of Florence because these were the parts of the city that all tourists visited. Due to Florence's background, the symbols were mostly vestiges of Tuscany's Renaissance, which was a significantly more flattering moment of Italian history than post-Renaissance centuries.

---

<sup>44</sup> Hilary Fraser. *The Victorians and Renaissance Italy*. (Oxford, UK ; Cambridge, Mass: Blackwell, 1992). 38

<sup>45</sup> Michele Falzone del Barbarò, Monica Maffioli, and Emanuela Sesti. *Alle Origini della Fotografia : Un Itinerario Toscano, 1839-1880*. (Firenze: Alinari, 1989). 104

The Palazzo del Bargello, begun in 1255, was one of the oldest surviving seats of the Florentine government. Also known as the Palazzo del Popolo and the Palazzo del Podestà, the Bargello acquired its name from its role as the headquarters of the chief of police. Its functions mirrored Italy's liberal progressions and regressions.<sup>46</sup> It has been used as a court house and a prison whose courtyard was the site of various executions. In 1865, it became the site of the Museo Nazionale.<sup>47</sup> Even today, the Palazzo is still known for its impressive collection of Renaissance sculpture. While the building was being completed in the fourteenth century, it was the seat of the powerful Guelph party's representational government which was run by the wealthy mercantile class instead of the nobility.<sup>48</sup>

The photograph of the Bargello highlighted its role as a medieval fortress.<sup>49</sup> The large tower rises up, dominating almost the entire picture plane. The crenellations on top of the Bargello are squared; they are hard, sharp and emotionless right-angles. Although there are a few instances of windows, the only entry into the fortress is a small door in the bottom right-hand corner of the image which is dwarfed by the looming massive structure looming. Although the door could be an entry way, it is ambiguous as to whether the door is open or not; it is too dark to tell. The incredible amount of detail invites contemplation, even as the sheer façade of the building repels the eye. The windows are all dark, the building lets the viewer look at the wall, but it cannot enter into the space. This is an image depicting power because it is entirely comprised of sharp angles and perfectly straight lines. The only arches are on top of the windows in the Bargello, and even these come to a point at the top.

---

<sup>46</sup> Christopher Hibbert. *Florence: The Biography of a City*. (1st American ed. New York ; London: W.W. Norton & Co, 1993) 325.

<sup>47</sup> Hibbert, 325.

<sup>48</sup> Hibbert, 20.

<sup>49</sup> Fratelli Alinari. The 'Palazzo del Bargello' in Florence, JPG, <http://www.alinariarchives.it/internal/Default.aspx> See Figure 1

## Italy after the Renaissance

During the eighteenth century, the peninsula became the scene of territorial scheming by outside forces who divided up the land. In the early eighteenth century, Lombardy and the Veneto region were under Austrian rule, while Naples and Sicily were under Spanish control.<sup>50</sup> With death of the last of the native Florentine Medici line in 1738, the Grand Duchy of Tuscany went to the Austrian Emperor, Francis Hapsburg, which was then inherited by his son, Prince Leopold who took up residence in Florence as the Grand Duke of Tuscany.<sup>51</sup> Much of central Italy was a part of the Papal States which were under the direct jurisdiction of the Pope in Rome and protected by the French army. It was important to Catholics internationally that the Pope have temporal, as well as spiritual, power because it kept the Pope from being at the mercy of lay governments.<sup>52</sup> Thus, most of Italy was controlled by either the Catholic Church or domestic and international nobility, indicating Italy's inability to self-govern.

Through the power of the photograph, the Alinari create an image that testifies to Florence's ability in governance. The lightly suggested hills in the background are completely dwarfed by the man-made structures in front. Even though Florence is situated in one of the most famously beautiful countryside, the surrounding area is completely ignored. This image is entirely about the urban environment that humans have created for themselves. It is a structure that is also a testament to the defense of that creation. It is a structure that was once used to wage war against the surrounding Italian city-states and survived to be used to defend against surrounding countries in defense of those Italian cities that were once enemies. The Bargello functions as a bridge between these two ideals. Its age, which is very apparent in the

---

<sup>50</sup> Arthur James Beresford Whyte. *The Evolution of Modern Italy*. (New York: Norton, 1965). 2.

<sup>51</sup> Whyte, 2.

<sup>52</sup> Whyte, 2.



photograph, attests that a group of wealthy tradesmen have not only built this structure but have already affectively ruled Florence.

### Florence as an Economic, Political and Military Power

Although Florence was one of the most important cities in Italy during the nineteenth century, it was also the least qualified to be the capital of Italy. Turin, the capital of the Piedmont region, became the leader of the war against the Austrians. During the second part of the Risorgimento, King Charles Albert of Piedmont led the military efforts. The first was in March of 1848; however, it was the second, in 1859, that King Charles Albert succeeded. Therefore, Turin became the first capital of Italy, from 1860 to 1865.<sup>53</sup>

The move to Florence was due to intra-regional strife in the Italian Parliament. The rest of Italy was envious of Piedmont's comparative importance, both as the main aggressor against the Austrians and as the home of Turin, Italy's capital city. In addition, it was difficult for Turin in the far north to be aware of the events in the south where there was growing unrest in Naples and Sicily. Count Camillo Cavour, a Piedmontese statesman and one of the masterminds behind the military effort against the Austrians, always knew that due to the power of Rome's history as the site of both the Roman Empire and the Vatican, it had to eventually become the capital of Italy. Therefore, the move from Turin to Florence allowed for another region to rise in importance; it moved the capital closer to the unstable South and was situated between Turin and Rome.

The Italians always knew that the move to Florence was temporary and in 1871, the capital moved to Rome, its third and final destination, finally ending the Risorgimento.<sup>54</sup> Rome had been under the military supervision of France since the Napoleonic period and even after

---

<sup>53</sup> Whyte, 57, 91, 93.

Napoleon's defeat, France was allowed to maintain troops in Rome in order to ensure the stability of the Pope's temporal power. During the Risorgimento, Italy was allied with France, which prohibited any movement towards the annexation of the Papal States. However, when France chose to go to war with Prussia, it removed all of its troops stationed in Rome and gave Italy the power of protecting the Pope in its place. Italy used the lack of any Roman military defense to march on the city. It annexed Rome and the Papal States in 1870, and in 1871 the government moved to Rome, effectively ending the Risorgimento.<sup>55</sup>

Despite the incidental nature of the move to Florence, the city was already well known as the home of rational governance. During the nineteenth century in Italy, one of the few places where a viable bourgeoisie developed was in Florence due to the Hapsburg Emperor's embrace of political reforms during the Enlightenment. Austria abandoned many of the old and contradictory laws in order to embrace a system of government that valued reason and efficiency. Although Emperor Joseph helped to spread the new emphasis on liberalism throughout his empire, including parts of Italy, it was his younger brother Leopold who made the most significant changes as the Grand Duke of Tuscany. Even through the worst periods of the following century, Tuscany almost always managed to emerge the least scathed. The Grand Duke Leopold created a middle class through the establishment of free trade and the abolishment of all restrictions on imports and exports. Tuscany became one of the best governed states in all of Italy. Therefore, even before Italian independence, Florence carried connotations of strength, rationality and stability.

In reaction to these conflicting narratives, the image of the Palazzo del Bargello, with its history of functioning as both a seat of the Florentine government and headquarters for the chief of police, focused on Florence as a powerful and stable city-state. One that was once governed

---

<sup>55</sup> Whyte, 180.

by the wealthy merchants and tradesmen and one that deserved to become the capital. The Palazzo del Bargello asserted the importance of the city of Florence because the effort and planning required to build a medieval fortress proved that Florence was a strong and an economically important city. Not only would the building of such a monument be complicated but it showed that Florence was a city worth attacking and defending. After the military successes by the Piedmont army, in both the battles of the Risorgimento against Austria and in the Crimean War, Tuscany had to prove its own military power. The building filled up the length of the photograph with a clarity that exemplified the traditional “Alinari Style”. This particular view was taken from the back of the building; it appeared as an aging, yet still imposing structure as evidenced by way in which it dwarfed the other, closely surrounding buildings

The image portrayed in the Alinari photograph moved away from linking Florence to art because despite the art that made Italy a superior country, the Alinari would not have wanted to portrayed a nation that only had great art and lacked a stable government. Therefore, although the Bargello had recently become the home of some of the greatest Renaissance sculptures the same year that the photograph was taken, none of that would be noticeable in this image. In its almost timeless quality, the image did not refer to any of the architecture that made Florence so famous; instead, the eye was treated only to this medieval structure and the small, unimportant buildings surrounding it. The large tower that reached towards the top of the image acted as a lookout, a protector; the strong protecting the weak. Therefore, this photograph showed the back of the building as a means of establishing its military might. The two parallel lines running across the length of the building and the distinctly medieval decorations created a sense of a stable power structure, comforting after years of political and social upheaval. Therefore, while the “Alinari style” showed the subject in the center, there was little else in the image besides the

subject, the light was even and the lines in the photograph were distinct, even though the style for the Romantic “High Art” photographs required that there be strong lights and darks and blurred lines.<sup>56</sup> Therefore, the Alinari were making a particular choice when they decided to not follow the fashion for making blurry and romantic High Art photographs. Instead, these photographs demonstrated an extreme clarity; the subject was presented frankly and without sentiment. No information is hidden from the viewer due to lighting techniques; even the small shadows created by the bricks on the wall of the Bargello were visible. In addition, all of the photographers in the Alinari firm, even after the death of Leopoldo, conformed to this style. After years of civil unrest in Italy, it was important to show that some Italians were prepared to thoughtfully assess their surroundings.

### British versus Italian Nationalism

It was also during the 1800s that the concept of nationhood and nationalism began to take hold in Europe. It was one of the primary social and political theories that shaped the resulting two hundred years. It is impossible to understand the history of Western Europe, let alone Italy, without understanding the underlying concepts of nationalism. The term “nation” does not have an exact definition because scholars still argue over the specific requirements.<sup>57</sup> Yet, it can be argued, a nation is a “social entity that belongs exclusively to a particular and historically recent period, it is a social entity only insofar as it relates to a certain kind of modern territorial state, the ‘nation-state’.”<sup>58</sup> A nation-state is a connected territory that organizes humanity in a specific way.<sup>59</sup> The population within a nation-state must also feel psychologically connected either

---

<sup>56</sup> Arturo Carlo Quintavalle and Fratelli Alinari. *Gli Alinari*. (Firenze: Alinari, 2003). 87.

<sup>57</sup> E. J. Hobsbawm. *Nations and Nationalism since 1780 : Programme, Myth, Reality*. (The Wiles Lectures. Cambridge England] ; New York: Cambridge University Press, 1990). 9

<sup>58</sup> Hobsbawm, 9.

<sup>59</sup> Hobsbawm, 9.

through a common language, ethnicity or past.<sup>60</sup> Thus, a nation-state is a connected geographical location in which the population imagines itself to be psychologically and historically connected as well.

Nationalism is in direct opposition to a monarchial system in which the king leads by Divine Right. It is the king, in this model, who is the state, whose decisions ultimately matter. Nationalism, instead, creates a myth that it is the people who are the state, or as E. J. Hobsbawm shows, “nation = state = people.”<sup>61</sup> Jack Snyder elaborates more fully on the definition of nationalism as the “doctrine that a people who see themselves as distinct in their culture, history, institutions, or principles should rule themselves in a political system that expresses and protects those distinctive characteristics.”<sup>62</sup> In addition, Hobsbawm states that nationalism is an alternative to the traditional class structure with an active nobility and monarchy, and that instead the people within a nation feel as though they are the sovereigns. If the people are sovereign, then there is an inherent equality within the nation, because everyone is a part of the ruling power.<sup>63</sup> Thus, the goal of nationalism is to have everyone conform to the belief that they are a distinct and superior people and to have similar goals for the future of their country. Although nationalism is an illusion, a means by which the elites can convince the populace of their equality and sovereignty, it was heavily used by the British by the eighteenth century and it became a significant part of their identity.<sup>64</sup>

Because nationalism requires the illusion of equality within the country, the sense of superiority forms between countries, not within them. Therefore, nationalism requires its participants to believe that their nation is the greatest due to its superior collective past. In the

---

<sup>60</sup> Hobsbawm, 5.

<sup>61</sup> Hobsbawm, 19-20.

<sup>62</sup> Jack L. Snyder. *From Voting to Violence : Democratization and Nationalist Conflict*. (1st ed. New York: Norton, 2000). 23

<sup>63</sup> Snyder, 20.

<sup>64</sup> Snyder, 45

case of the British, their national pride stemmed from their political, economic and industrial capabilities. Britain further supported its foray into nationalism with its capitalistic economic plan because in order to be considered a nation a country's economy had to be large enough to support industrial development in addition to having sufficient cultural or linguistic background.<sup>65</sup> Between traveling to Italy, hearsay and literature, the British were well aware of these gaps in Italian nationalism.

Italy fulfilled none of the requirements for a nation-state. It was internally divided. Massimo d'Azeglio, the first minister of the newly united Italian Kingdom, responded to this lack of a psychological unity by stating "We have made Italy, now we have to make Italians."<sup>66</sup> Even during the Renaissance there was no sense of continuity between the various city-states. The history of each of the regions varied wildly; they even spoke different dialects of Italian which were incomprehensible to those living outside of the region. Their economic plan was mainly agrarian, with no movement in place for industrial capabilities.

Due to Italy's unique position of being both older and younger than most of the nation-states in Europe, it could be selective in what parts of its past it chose to remember when it was creating its nationalist myth. The British witnessed firsthand the internal strife that had occurred in the years following the Renaissance. Yet, they continued to visit the country due to its rich art and history spanning from the Romans through the Renaissance. In order to be seen as a cohesive nation-state, Italy needed to create a believable nationalist myth that proved both Italy's superiority and its psychological unification.<sup>67</sup> Documenting and disseminating photographs of Florentine monuments from the Renaissance would create a myth that Italians had a collective past and that this past included great art.

---

<sup>65</sup> Hobsbawm, 30, 32.

<sup>66</sup> Hobsbawm, 44.

<sup>67</sup> Synder, 23

It was important to present an image of a powerful political structure because, despite unification, contemporary Italian politics were chaotic. Instead of becoming a governmental body in which the public actively engaged, Parliament was already becoming a “self-conscious organism in which the public took small interest.”<sup>68</sup> Parliament’s removal from the Italian consciousness was not surprising because the majority of Italians did not participate in the Risorgimento.<sup>69</sup> They were dispassionate about the war for independence, so the resulting government did not hold their interest either. They did not feel connected to the rest of the country and therefore their parliamentary representatives were unwilling to concede the needs of their districts in order to focus on benefiting the country as a whole. In response, the photograph highlights the imposing qualities of the monument while also stressing its previous function as the home of a representational government. Although at first glance the photograph of the Bargello was surprisingly difficult to penetrate since the fortress juts out, cutting off access, there is still the street that runs next to the building, giving the eye entry. Therefore, like the building itself, there is initially an imposing quality but still a desire for active participation by the viewer. Italy was not the only European country trying to integrate the general public into civic participation; the 1860s also marked the beginnings of Hausmannization in Paris, whose large boulevards requested the Parisians to interact with the city on a greater scale. Thus, although in practice most Italians were disinterested in their government, the photograph required active participation.

By 1861, with the first *Exposizione Italiana* in Florence after the Italian unification, there was already an emphasis on Italy as unified in both the cultural and political sense by showing that the Tuscan art and countryside was no longer simply Tuscan but Italian.<sup>70</sup> There was

---

<sup>68</sup> Whyte, 147

<sup>69</sup> Whyte, 142

<sup>70</sup> Falzone del Barbaró, 83

already an emphasis on the art and monuments throughout Italy in order to create a single history through a multiplicity of different ones.<sup>71</sup> The Alinari followed this trend. For example, after the death of Leopoldo Alinari in 1865, the catalogues that followed show how Giuseppe and Romualdo Alinari were interested in covering not only the Tuscan countryside and Florence, but the entire patrimony of Italy, as a testament to the collective national artistic identity.<sup>72</sup> Even today in Italy there is not a strong sense of connection throughout the peninsula, and Italians would probably be insulted by such a proposition. Regionalism is still strong and most Italians make a point of referring to the achievements of their region, as opposed to Italy as a whole.

By giving everyone access to the same image, the photograph can teach people how to see similarly, which is important when establishing a national identity. The objective of a photograph of a monument was to portray the subject in the way a traveler could have seen it. If someone became acquainted with the image before seeing the subject firsthand, they would use the perspective of the photograph to determine how to look at the subject. Therefore, photography allowed the photographer to form the way in which people collectively thought about art, cities or even countries because people would all conform to looking at the monument in the same way that it had been presented to them in an image. Therefore, within photographs, such as the Palazzo del Bargello, there is an inherent tension between the photograph's ability to represent reality and to manipulate how people approached reality. They gained even more prominence in the collective imagination when these photographs became illustrations in editorials and guidebooks about tourism in Florence. Their photographs dictated the means in which the British, especially the ones who had never visited Italy, imagined Italy. Therefore, to

---

<sup>71</sup> Fabro del Barbaró, 85.

<sup>72</sup> *Gli Alinari*, 169.



see the Alinari photograph was to see the Bargello without going to Florence. It was the photograph that, in the end, became the meaning of how people see in modern society.<sup>73</sup>

Even as a medium, the act of taking pictures of these venerated structures heightens the ability by which people can participate in the image. A photograph makes the image more available to more people who can see them before they visit. The action of taking a photograph of a Renaissance monument shows that the means of accessing the monument is being popularized, in the same way as the sovereignty of the nation. Someone from Britain did not have to go to Italy, a luxury not afforded by many, to see this image, in the same way that everyone could join into the nationalist myth. In addition, one of the benefits of a photograph is that a person can handle it, organize it, collect it; so there is already a belief of ownership over the image itself. The image, as taken by the Alinari, is supposed to be a window into reality because it is so clear, despite the lack of color. This widening of public space is not only physical, but psychological as well. It allows for those who in the past who were not able to participate in the public sphere to have power by controlling this image.

The extreme clarity of the image is able to both invite and refute the British gaze. The extreme detail seems to ask that the viewer notice all of the different aspects of the image, to take the time to look at everything because there is so much information available to the viewer. However, while the style invites contemplation, the subject does not. The Bargello's flat façade, its only decoration is a few scattered windows, does not provide the viewer with much at which to look. The jutting corner and the simple façade makes it difficult for the viewer to completely enter into the picture. Even the windows are dark enough that the eye cannot pass through in order to see inside the Bargello. Therefore, even though the other buildings that have managed to nudge their way into the photograph provide more visual interest, they are obviously not the

---

<sup>73</sup> Fabro del Barbaró, 12

focus of the photograph, and the eye continuously returns back to the Bargello. The image becomes powerful because it is able to make the viewer want to look deeper in order to discover the different details, while the subject refutes the gaze by not allowing for the eye to completely enter into the picture. Thus, the Alinari peak the interest of the British viewers, through the detailed image that is supposed to offer itself to the eye without complaint, without compromising the pride of the structure and the people it represents.

There is an ambiguity to the image that refers to an iconography with which foreign tourists would be familiar. Although the Bargello is one of Florence's most famous monuments, the Alinari approached the image from behind and situated so that it alludes to structures much more central European or even English in origin and less overtly Italian. Instead of the stereotypical Italian Renaissance curves, it is entirely rectangular. English imagery alludes to stronger and more stable military and political systems. For example, comparing this image of the Palazzo del Bargello with Bodiam Castle in England, built between 1386 and 1390, there is the similar emphasis on a plain, nearly unbroken façade.<sup>74</sup> Both of these buildings have the same cannellations on top and the sheer size and weight of the structures are emphasized through the layering of brick and stone and the lack of delicate detail. By showing the Bargello at this angle, the Alinari were reminding the viewer that these buildings, and other fortresses like the castle, were constructed contemporaneously. The Gothic windows, as shown by the Alinari, are appealing to an imagery that would approach a more international audience by alluding to a symbolism that would reference architecture outside of the country itself.

The goal behind many of the Alinari photographs was to create a visual guide for those who were both participating in and interacting with the new country. They took pictures of

---

<sup>74</sup> Sussex: Bodiam Castle Gen, JPG, <http://library.artstor.org.ezproxy.library.tufts.edu/library/welcome.html>  
See Figure 2.

important monuments and artwork but also of important figures.<sup>75</sup> Because Italy was still so new, the Alinari almost created an encyclopedia of the images of the famous men in Italy so that they could be seen throughout the country, meaning that the rest of Italy would know these famous men by sight. They were beginning to embrace the modern concept of creating a cult of celebrity, allowing for everyone throughout the country to venerate the same men and giving them something else to have in common. These images could also be exported to allow the rest of Europe to also know by sight the important Italian politicians, artists and thinkers. Therefore, they were creating a nationalist myth; they were showing those aspects of their country that they deemed to be superior.

---

<sup>75</sup> Quintavalle and Maffioli, 32.

## **Chapter 2: The Duomo**

### My argument:

My argument is that the British sense of nationalism caused them to believe that they were the next evolutionary step in regards to Italy, especially concerning religion and art. Therefore, because their position was one of superiority, the Victorian British historians felt comfortable fabricating an Italian Renaissance that was decadent and immoral. They believed that it was Catholicism that inevitably sowed the moral and societal destruction of the Renaissance, and that the Catholic religion continued to make Italy a backward country. As a consequence of this feeling of superiority, the British also began to appropriate aspects of the Italian Renaissance artistic tradition.

It is through the photograph of the Duomo that the Alinari are able to re-appropriate the Italian artistic tradition and demonstrate Italy's sophistication, both during the Renaissance and during the 1860s. Although there are many views of the Duomo, this one is of the back, focusing only on the construction of the Dome. The Dome is still one of the most technologically advanced structures, even though it was built during the Renaissance and it is the nave of a Catholic Cathedral. The Alinari show it in a style that heightens the rationalism behind its construction and de-emphasizes any theatricality that might be associated with Catholicism. In addition, by photographing the Duomo, the Alinari are also presenting contemporary Italy's technological and societal sophistication because photography was still a new medium.

### Intro

If the Bargello is the symbol of the effective governance of the Italian nation-state, then the dome on top of Florence's cathedral, Santa Maria del Fiore, is a testament to the political

success, artistic talent, and ingenuity of the bourgeoisie Renaissance.<sup>76</sup> Though the construction of the cathedral began in 1296, work on the dome, which was engineered by Filippo Brunelleschi, did not begin until 1420. The dome, which is still one of the largest in the world and the largest made of brick, was finished in 1436.<sup>77</sup> Despite the dome's prominence as one of the greatest architectural achievements of the Tuscan Renaissance, the direct heir of its achievements was disputed. Since the inception of the Grand Tour in the seventeenth century, the British believed that they were inherently superior to the Italians. Following the Hegelian theory of evolution, the British saw themselves as the next phase in the progression of great art, following Greece, Rome, the Italian Renaissance and the Northern Renaissance. Thus, their belief that their paintings and sculptures were the next great artistic movement meant that they also believed that it was justifiable to appropriate the parts of the Italian Renaissance that they found to be most appealing.<sup>78</sup> Their sense of entitlement also extended to their academics; it was the British Victorians who named and defined the era known as the Renaissance.<sup>79</sup> Thus, since the Renaissance was essentially their own construction, they used it as an opportunity to create the Renaissance that they wanted to have existed. The Victorian historians manufactured the Renaissance into an era of decadence in order to create an antithesis to their own society. Yet the Italians wanted to reclaim the Renaissance for their own and use it as an example of pragmatic, merchant success in government.

The Alinari used imagery, such as the photograph of the dome, to subtly complicate the prevailing stereotypes of the Renaissance. As the Renaissance in the imagination of the British Victorians grew more fantastic, their interest in Italy's modern manifestation waned. The

---

<sup>76</sup> Fratelli Alinari. Apse of the Cathedral of Florence, JPG, <http://www.alinariarchives.it/internal/Default.aspx> See Figure 3.

<sup>77</sup> Ross King. *Brunelleschi's Dome: How a Renaissance Genius Reinvented Architecture*. (New York: Walker & Co, 2000) 49; 140.

<sup>78</sup> Hilary Fraser. *The Victorians and Renaissance Italy*. (Oxford, UK ; Cambridge, Mass: Blackwell, 1992) 3.

<sup>79</sup> Fraser, 3.

imagery had a difficult task because it functioned as a linchpin, drawing the Italians together while not allowing Italy's past to eclipse its present. Through the photograph, the Alinari were able to disseminate a version of Italian nationalism, while also demonstrating the modernity of Italy's current situation. The use of the camera proved Italy's ability to use modern technology. Therefore, without stating anything directly, the photograph of Brunelleschi's dome communicated the technical advances of Italy's past without disregarding Italy's modernity.

### Eighteenth Century British Stereotypes of the Italians

The mid-nineteenth century British traveler inherited the eighteenth century stereotypes of the Italians because it gave them a means of coping with their sense of national identity. As the British in the eighteenth century became more aware of England's growing nationalism, their sense of identity became more entangled with their nationality and the religion particular to their country. Thus, travel caused them to feel anxious about traveling outside of England because they believed that to leave England in order to learn about another culture was questioning their loyalty to their home country. In addition, they believed that their nationality was an integral part of their identity and that traveling away from England, for even a short time, could question it. The British anxiety about Italy was exacerbated because Italy was the seat of the Papal government and the haven for Jacobin supporters and thus represented Catholicism, the natural enemy of the English Church.<sup>80</sup> In response, the English viewed their Church as a source of national identity and chosen difference. Therefore, in order to combat the potential loss of identity, they fashioned an image of the Italians that would not only be different but also inferior to the British.

---

<sup>80</sup>Jeremy Black. *Italy and the Grand Tour*. (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2003), 5.

England's society progressed rapidly during the Age of Enlightenment and into the Industrial Revolution; the massive changes made the British people feel sentimental and superior towards the past. As Jeremy Black described, traveling to the less industrialized Italy became the equivalent to traveling back in time.<sup>81</sup> Therefore, he argued that the British turned Italy into a theme park of the classical age in order to satisfy their nostalgia for a simpler time.<sup>82</sup> Italy became a culture that could be suppressed by turning it into the toothless vestiges of the past that could not compete with the breakneck pace at which England was progressing. The traveler in the eighteenth century believed that Italy was in a romantic state of decline after the glory of the Roman Empire and the Tuscan Renaissance.<sup>83</sup> Their version of Italy forced them to disregard all of the social and political reforms that were implemented by the Hapsburgs in the 1700s, in regions such as Lombardy, Venetia and Tuscany.<sup>84</sup> Instead, they believed that Italy was the home to "noble savages" who were slowly deteriorating amid decadent surroundings.<sup>85</sup> The feelings of national superiority were visible in the treatment of the Italians by the British. Despite the hospitality they received in Italy, "it would not be unfair to claim that many returned to Britain as better-informed xenophobes."<sup>86</sup> In most cases, the portrayal of Italian society was hostile because the British believed that the Italians spent too much time with the arts and not enough time on politics, society or the economy.<sup>87</sup> The British felt their system was greatly superior and that those who were not also industrializing were denying natural progress. The result was that even in the eighteenth century, Italy's past had become more important than its future in the eyes of the British.

---

<sup>81</sup> Black, 7.

<sup>82</sup> Black, 7.

<sup>83</sup> Black, 140.

<sup>84</sup> Black, 147.

<sup>85</sup> Black, 160.

<sup>86</sup> Black, 12.

<sup>87</sup> Black, 14.

Since the British tourist's version of Italy was a creation, it allowed England to eroticize Italy so that it seemed powerless. The British viewed Italy as a destination for sexual perversion because the English believed that homosexuality was a by-product of Catholicism. They believed that the celibacy of Catholicism was an outdated notion and that it led to sexual perversion. In addition, because the majority of the people traveling to Italy were young, rich and poorly supervised men, there were many reports of sexual deviancy that were subsequently sensationalized by the British media.<sup>88</sup> These young men viewed Florence as a city which one could have an active sex life with the locals and were further impressed by an institutionalized form of adultery, called Cicibeship, in which a married man could court a married woman who was not his wife.<sup>89</sup> Thus, Italy was deemed as less powerful due to its inability to conform to the acknowledged moral familial structure of the British and therefore could not progress at the same rate as England.<sup>90</sup>

The liberties taken by the British Victorians concerning their interpretation of the Renaissance were not much different from those taken by the Renaissance scholars concerning the classical past.<sup>91</sup> During the Renaissance, one of the founding principles of "re-birth," was appropriating concepts from the classics and relating them to the present situation. Therefore, humanists looked at thinkers and artists who they believed came from a morally degraded pagan society for new ideas, while simultaneously believing their own Christian society to be superior. The Victorians, despite their judgments about Renaissance society, still believed that Raphael represented the peak of artistic endeavors. However, the British Victorian artists, such as Turner, believed that they were Raphael's direct artistic descendents.<sup>92</sup> Thus, by appropriating the Italian past, they were actively taking it away from the contemporary Italians. In contrast, the

---

<sup>88</sup> Black, 118.

<sup>89</sup> Black, 126.

<sup>90</sup> Black, 130.

<sup>91</sup> Fraser, 40.

<sup>92</sup> Fraser, 44.



Renaissance thinkers were only appropriating their own history; they looked to the Roman Empire for examples of classical texts and sculptures.

### Italian Catholicism as Decadent and Primitive

During the nineteenth century, because no significant historical research had been done on the period, the Renaissance functioned as a blank template. Therefore, the Renaissance gave the British a canvas to project their fantasies. After the austerity of the classical ruins, the Renaissance was not embraced openly for the first fifty years of the century. Instead, as Hilary Fraser described, the British Victorians originally viewed the Renaissance as an overly decadent society in order show that their society was morally superior. They used the Renaissance as an example to show how a society with values different from their own would create its own destruction. Thus, the Renaissance was living proof that fascination with the arts, Catholicism and general luxury and decadence could lead towards the destruction of society.<sup>93</sup>

Fraser argued that the Victorians believed that the religious artwork from the Renaissance was immoral; it was primarily focused on making the subject beautiful, not communicating its sacredness. Viewing Renaissance artwork through this lens allowed the Victorian British to acknowledge and enjoy the beauty of the works while continuing to show Italy's inferior qualities. It permitted them to travel to Italy for an artistic education without placing stress on their sense of nationalism. Thus, their views on the culture allowed them to remain morally superior while appropriating the aspects of the Renaissance they found most appealing.

The Victorian's prime objective concerning the Renaissance was to provide an instructive parallel or contrast with their current society, even though many of its faults were similar to the

---

<sup>93</sup> Fraser, 39.

problems in their own era.<sup>94</sup> Therefore, the Victorians created an almost erotic Renaissance that fit into their conception of uninhibited moral failure because, “History’s task was to resurrect the past in such a way that it should appear to be both authentic and autonomous, even though the complementary demand for relevance to the present actually militated against the desired data.”<sup>95</sup> Although John Ruskin, an important contemporary British art critic, originally believed that the Renaissance caused moral degradation and that its art and architecture was ethically corrosive, he still thought it was constructive to study Renaissance sepulchral sculptures. In order to calm their anxiety, the early Victorians contrasted a society that was completely at odds with their own. Ruskin believed that the monuments could provide an instructive antithesis of good behavior.<sup>96</sup> However, according to Fraser, Ruskin was actually highlighting his anxiety about the changes in England because these were parts of the Renaissance that related too closely to modern Victorian society. Therefore, his writings describe his feelings as a mixture of disgust and fascination due to the Italian Renaissance artists’ emphasis on beauty over simple spirituality. For example, he argued that “the Renaissance spirit [due to] its worldliness, inconsistency, pride, ignorance, love of art, of luxury and of good Latin” would teach its viewers immorality.<sup>97</sup> Yet, this did not prohibit Victorian society from appropriating its motifs, such as the South Kensington museum which was based on a sepulchral monument after the architect traveled throughout Italy.<sup>98</sup>

Ruskin used the Renaissance as an excuse to allay his discomfort with Italian Catholicism. He decreed that Rome, which functioned as a symbol for both Italy and Catholicism, was a sepulchral monument. He described it as a “beautiful, crumbling tomb,

---

<sup>94</sup> Fraser, 24

<sup>95</sup> Fraser 38.

<sup>96</sup> Fraser, 21.

<sup>97</sup> Fraser, 23, 30.

<sup>98</sup> Fraser, 26.

collapsing under its own decadent and decaying beauty.”<sup>99</sup> In addition, he was contemptuous of the theatricality present in Bernini’s baroque “St. Theresa” in Rome, although his descriptions of the monuments employ similar techniques.<sup>100</sup> Therefore, he described the Catholic Renaissance in overly dramatic terms, yet, chastised the period for its theatricality. Thus, the British Victorians convinced themselves that Catholicism had also fallen prey to the same vices as the Renaissance because it was interested in art and theatrics. Between the Renaissance and Catholicism, the Victorians were effectively disregarding all aspects of Italian society and history as immoral and destined for failure.

The view of Rome that Ruskin described was applicable to Catholicism in Florence as well. For example, in E.M. Foster’s A Room with a View, when Lucy Honeychurch walks into Santa Croce in Florence during the early 1900s, she starts to think that, “There was no one even to tell her which, of all the sepulchral slabs that paved the nave and transepts, was the one that was really beautiful, the one that had been most praised by Mr. Ruskin.” Therefore, he made similar pronouncements about Florence’s sepulchral monuments.

The Alinari had to fashion Catholicism as both a means of connecting Italy without becoming threatening to British travelers.<sup>101</sup> Since the English were already well aware that their religion was an important component of their national identity, the Italians needed to use Catholicism in the same way. Therefore, the image presented of the Duomo is one of restrained and stable veneration; it is without the theatrics that the British associated with Catholicism. The Alinari showed the simple geometric quality of the cathedral, the rising tiers of semi-circles that begin at the first level, to the supporting half domes and finally the dome itself. The dome did not contain extra architectural ornamentation. The supporting structures below the dome were all

---

<sup>99</sup> Fraser, 33.

<sup>100</sup> Fraser, 37.

<sup>101</sup> Black, 94

necessary; without them the dome would collapse. Although designs were present on the walls of the building, they were simple and geometric. Thus, this building was not a remnant of Gothic architecture; it was not supposed to fill the viewer with awe. Instead, it was a rationally composed building; all of the parts that kept the dome standing were visible. The Alinari heightened the lack of romanticism by photographing the structure in neutral lighting; there were no strong lights and darks to make it seem mysterious. Instead, everything in the image was visible to the viewer. Thus, the Alinari were not asking the viewer to feel a rush of emotion to accompany the image of spirituality, instead they asked for rational, removed contemplation. As Roland Barthes, who describes the concepts of punctum and studium in photography, the studium is the “application to a thing, taste for someone, a kind of general, enthusiastic commitment, of course, but without special acuity.”<sup>102</sup> Therefore, it was the punctum which “is that accident which pricks me (but also bruises me, is poignant to me).”<sup>103</sup> The Alinari seemed to be drawn entirely into the studium, making it the punctum. The image was entirely about information; the image was not preoccupied with an emotional aspect. Their images repelled the poignancy of the subjects in order to delve deeper into the information presented. They presented the Cathedral with the same neutral eye that showed the Bargello and the Uffizi.

By taking a photograph of the dome, the Alinari presented it as an important and stable part of the Florentine skyline. The Duomo was presented as imposing; it encompassed the majority of the space provided and the stone and brick building seemed heavy. There were no dainty ornamentations that would make the monument seem light and airy, instead the varying geometric shapes of the building referred to weighty volumes. The Duomo was a symbol of not only Italy, but also its main religion. Catholicism was an important part of the Italian identity and

---

<sup>102</sup> Roland Barthes. *Camera Lucida : Reflections on Photography*. (1st American ed. New York: Hill and Wang, 1981). 26.

<sup>103</sup> Barthes, 27.

it did function as a connection between the disparate Italian regions. Unlike in Ruskin's description of Rome as a sepulchral monument that was in the process of decay, the thick heavy lines of the building seemed strong. Through the different structures that hold up the dome, the viewer can imagine that the dome was stable. In addition, there was no evidence of decay. Catholicism was not presented as mysterious, or something that the British should be worried about, but it was shown as immovable and an important part of Italians' daily life.

Catholicism was viewed more favorably when the Pre-Raphaelites, a group of British artists founded in 1848, tried to copy the spiritual purity of early Renaissance frescoes in order to produce a sacred art for the nineteenth century.<sup>104</sup> However, they viewed the Catholicism of the early Renaissance as a primitive religion. However, these artists believed that the works by Raphael, da Vinci and Michelangelo from the High Renaissance were still too dependent on beauty. Thus, to copy them would be inappropriate if they wanted to restore sacred art and religion into the rapidly modernizing world. The Pre-Raphaelites, Rossetti, Millais and Hunt, as well as the art critic Ruskin, began to move away from the overly finished academic paintings.<sup>105</sup> If the image too closely resembled reality, they worried that the viewer would become overly concerned with visual qualities, not its message of spirituality.<sup>106</sup> Therefore, they believed that the artwork from the High Renaissance was too beautiful; it distracted the viewer from the religious message. Fraser argued that the prevailing theory during this era was that aesthetic achievement was detrimental to one's moral character. Therefore, Ruskin called Raphael the "ruin of art" because although it displayed religious subjects it was primarily a means of showing something beautiful.<sup>107</sup>

---

<sup>104</sup> Fraser, 30,32.

<sup>105</sup> Fraser, 87.

<sup>106</sup> Fraser, 89.

<sup>107</sup> Fraser, 100-1.

The Pre-Raphaelites took an interest in the early Renaissance artists because they believed that through primitive artwork they could more effectively transmit their message.<sup>108</sup> Yet, while the Pre-Raphaelites were supposedly copying the early Renaissance artist, their art did not resemble the art from the Quattrocento very closely. Instead, as Fraser explains, “It is the Renaissance the Pre-Raphaelites constructed which was of interest for Victorian cultural history.”<sup>109</sup> Therefore, even when the British chose to view the Italians in a more positive light, it was still through the lens of a superior country viewing an inferior one.

Although the British viewed the Renaissance as either primitive or decadent, the Duomo was neither, even though it was situated between the early and the High Renaissance.<sup>110</sup> The Duomo was not primitive because it was the largest brick dome in the world when built, which meant that it required a great deal of technical sophistication to accomplish. The dome was also not decadent because there were no unnecessary additions to the structure. The aesthetic of the dome was a series of semi-circles that build upon each other. Although the British argued that the immorality of the Renaissance eventually corroded society, the photograph demonstrated the continued existence of this dome. The image functioned as a testament to the stability of the Italian state, although in this case it was for Italian morality. Following the logic of the British, Renaissance society could not be completely immoral because not all of its products crumbled.

#### The Use of the Duomo to Prove Contemporary Italy's Modernization

During the nineteenth century, the British view of the Italians did not change much, which meant that the Alinari were confronted with the same stereotypes. The Risorgimento managed to arouse some sympathy with the British travelers, but the sympathy was short lived

---

<sup>108</sup> Fraser, 66.

<sup>109</sup> Fraser, 133.

<sup>110</sup> King, 49, 140.

since once the revolution was over, England lost interest.<sup>111</sup> However, Italy was already being viewed more positively as the Renaissance became fashionable during the Victorian era which, consequently, mandated that British artists travel to Italy as a means of education.<sup>112</sup> Therefore, even in the nineteenth century, the Alinari had to navigate between England's sense of nationalism and Italy's claims of modernity. The Italy presented in the Alinari photograph lacked any reference to modern developments, there were no people dressed in contemporary clothing or newer buildings. Instead, the only signifier of Italy's modernization was the photograph itself. Unlike the subject, the photograph was a recent development.

The shift in interest from the early to High Renaissance was due to the British bourgeoisie because they gained a greater exposure to the artwork and, as a result, altered the way art was consumed. In 1857, Manchester had a huge exhibition based on privately owned collections that was immensely popular. It was called the Art Treasures exhibition and it exposed many people to Renaissance artwork for the first time.<sup>113</sup> The Renaissance became important to the Victorians because it became accessible to a more varied group of individuals. Yet, despite the growing emphasis on the Renaissance, the British view of the Italians had not transformed.

The Alinari took pictures of the architecture, like the Dome, that exemplified the middle class. The dome was commissioned by the guilds for the city of Florence, which was governed by the merchants and bankers. While not technically a middle class because that is a nineteenth century concept, Florentine Renaissance society was not driven by kings, princes or nobles but wealthy merchants. Therefore, the Dome was a testament to the power of a trade-based society to create important, long lasting structures.

---

<sup>111</sup> Black, 165.

<sup>112</sup> Black, 181.

<sup>113</sup> Fraser, 68.

By the 1860s, the British artists and critics began viewing the Renaissance more favorably. By the end of the 1850s, Pre-Raphaelitism was no longer in style and instead the Venetian High Renaissance was inspiring British artists.<sup>114</sup> By the 1860s, when Florence became the capital of Italy, artwork from the High Renaissance was viewed as superior to the works of the early Renaissance.<sup>115</sup> Even Ruskin, who always believed that the society of the Italian Renaissance was sinful, became more interested in Botticelli and Carpaccio. In popular culture, Leonardo di Vinci and Michelangelo came into vogue.<sup>116</sup> The British interest in the High Renaissance lasted throughout the rest of the nineteenth century.<sup>117</sup>

As the Renaissance grew in popularity in the late 1850s and 60s, so did British sympathies for the Risorgimento. The British believed that the democratic nature of the Risorgimento showed that Italy was becoming a more moral society, causing them to conflate the Renaissance, Italy and the Risorgimento into a tangle of signifiers and signifieds. Therefore, as both the High Renaissance and the Risorgimento became more popular, British artists began looking to Italy for inspiration.<sup>118</sup> They traveled to Italy to draw copies of Renaissance artwork in order to incorporate the Old Master styles into their work which would add weight and authority to their own treatment of heroic, sacred or mythological subjects.<sup>119</sup> Thus, to the British, the Tuscan Renaissance was becoming equated with all of Italy.<sup>120</sup>

The conflated symbolism between Italy, the Renaissance and the Risorgimento was not confined solely to visual artists. Many contemporary British poets who were sympathetic to Italian unification, such as Swinburne, Clough and Barrett Browning, would allude to parts of

---

<sup>114</sup> Fraser, 125.

<sup>115</sup> Fraser, 125

<sup>116</sup> Fraser, 126-7

<sup>117</sup> Fraser, 129, 132

<sup>118</sup> Fraser, 71.

<sup>119</sup> Fraser, 73-4.

<sup>120</sup> Fraser, 212



the Renaissance in order to discuss the Risorgimento.<sup>121</sup> The poets helped to make High Renaissance a symbol for all of Italy. Yet, despite their desire to see Italy independent and unified, the British poets had not entirely disabused themselves of the belief that Britain was still morally and culturally superior. For example, in Bulwer-Lytton's Book of Rienzo, published in 1848, which was written to remind the Italians of the contemporary struggle against despotic rule contained the line, "the Italian maxim-never to fight an enemy while it is possible to cheat him."<sup>122</sup> The British might have been sympathetic but they did not change their views of the Italians.

The photograph of the Duomo had to become a symbol of unification, but it could overshadow contemporary Italy. By taking a photograph of the Duomo, the Alinari were re-appropriating the monument. Through the camera, the Alinari were able to show how a Florentine views Florence. In regards to the British, they had already been made aware of the monument as a necessary site on their tour but did not have a stronger connection to the image or the building. Therefore, through the mass dissemination of the photograph, the Alinari were able to have some control over how people see the monument. These images accompanied the British back to England as souvenirs who would look at them in order to remember their stay. Thus, these images would become synonymous with their travels throughout Italy. Eventually, as the sheer number of copies of this photograph increased, it could even become a symbol of the country, not just the journey undertaken by the tourist.

Because there was not much scholarship on the High Renaissance until the last thirty years of the nineteenth century, the Alinari offered an unbiased approach to these monuments.<sup>123</sup> Even still, the "late nineteenth century English concept of the Renaissance is a political hybrid of

---

<sup>121</sup> Fraser, 169.

<sup>122</sup> Fraser, 189.

<sup>123</sup> Fraser, 212.

Michlet and Burckhardt with an apparent disregard for their ideological differences, yoking together elitist and populist views on culture, government, belongs to the reactionary radical English tradition of Carlyle, Ruskin and Arnold.”<sup>124</sup> The scholarship continued the trend of viewing Italy within the Hegelian context in which Britain was not only more evolved but also the natural recipient of the Italian artistic tradition.<sup>125</sup> The British Renaissance historians saw history as a torch race beginning with Greece to Italy to Northern Europe and concluding with America and Australia.<sup>126</sup> There still remained an obsession with Renaissance Italy as morally corrupt and hellish which was the Victorian historians reacting to something foreign, if unfairly.<sup>127</sup> Even though the Renaissance that the historians documented was more of a construction, it was sympathetic and respectful and generally anti-Medieval.<sup>128</sup> There was less of a distinction between the middle Ages and the Renaissance although the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries were generally viewed as Medieval instead of Renaissance.<sup>129</sup>

By the end of the nineteenth century, the view of the Renaissance became more positive and forgiving. Eventually, the British Victorians began to view the Renaissance as the beginning of the modern transition from the corrupt and obsolete to the free and enlightened civilizations of the modern world with less emphasis on its moral degradation.<sup>130</sup> They realized that Renaissance classicism was a positive achievement and not a form of latent paganism.<sup>131</sup> The integration of paganism and Catholicism in art became more socially acceptable because it could create a beautiful object.<sup>132</sup> It was beauty that became the Renaissance’s saving grace to the Victorian historians because beauty became an end instead of a means and art’s “liberty” of

---

<sup>124</sup> Fraser, 213

<sup>125</sup> Fraser, 229

<sup>126</sup> Fraser, 218.

<sup>127</sup> Fraser, 228.

<sup>128</sup> Fraser, 228

<sup>129</sup> Fraser, 228

<sup>130</sup> Fraser, 234-5

<sup>131</sup> Fraser, 239

<sup>132</sup> Fraser, 240

outlook over the whole range of human interests predisposed it towards a freedom of the mind.<sup>133</sup>

It was not until then that the Victorians were able to see Renaissance art for art's sake alone. By the end of the Victorian period, the historians began to view the Renaissance as indicative of Rebirth, or at least the birth of the modern world in both the spiritual and artistic sense.<sup>134</sup>

The Duomo that is presented to the viewer in this context is one that refers to Italy as a stable and sophisticated country. It is the frankness of the photograph which combats the prevailing views of the British about the Italians. The photograph is nothing more than a picture of building. Yet, the photograph proves that the Duomo is still standing, despite many of the descriptions of the Renaissance that seem to refute the Italians ability to construct such a long-lasting structure. On the surface, is no punctum; there is nothing here that truly grabs the eye. Yet, the studium becomes the punctum because that is what draws in the viewers. It is a photograph meant for dispassionate perusal; it is supposed to only relay information, to let the viewer know what the Duomo looks like from this particular angle. As in the Bargello, this photograph refutes the contemporary style of "High Art" photography that required that clear presentation of reality be blurred. Thus, there is nothing in this image that relates to the British image of Italy and the Renaissance as a decadent and immoral society. Instead, if this image were to circulate around England, it would show Italy and Florence to be rational because of the practicality and ingenuity that was required to build the structure.

---

<sup>133</sup> Fraser, 240.

<sup>134</sup> Fraser, 247.

## **Chapter 3: The Uffizi**

### My Argument

My argument is that the Alinari used the history of art in Italy to sell a nationalist myth to the British. The story the Alinari perpetuated is that the Italians lived among great artwork and that it is accessible to all Italian citizens. The Alinari are showing the British that Italy's national pride is based on its artistic tradition. In addition, the composition of the photograph is like the concept of nationalism. The image initially appears to be imposing, as the two wings of the Uffizi rise up on either side of the viewer. Yet, it is also inviting, as the perspective throws the viewer into the piazza.

The photograph is the only means in which the Alinari could put forth their form of nationalism. As a museum that carries some of the most well-known artwork in Europe, it must appear to be solid, serious and unyielding. Yet, as a museum available to both the local and visiting public, it also has to be welcoming. Through the medium of photography, the Alinari create an image that had the aura of stability and importance while also maintaining its accessibility.

### Intro

Italy had always been known for its artistic tradition; it was an inescapable part of its history and legacy. Although the Alinari also documented paintings, it was the Italian architecture coupled with photography, not paintings, that allowed for the Alinari to make their case for nationalism. The Alinari, by taking photographs of these buildings, functioned as both interpreters of their most famous monuments but also artists in their own right, adding a new set of images into the Italian cultural lexicon. However, these images were photographs, a completely new medium whose complicated relationship with reality added new levels of

exposition and manipulation. The photograph of the Uffizi was powerful because it managed to simultaneously prove Italy's political stability through its centuries-long continued existence, the re-appropriation of Italy's artistic tradition, all the while being infinitely reproducible.<sup>135</sup> The photograph was able to show the elite nature of Italy, the idea that Italians lived surrounded by great art and architecture, even though photography was considered to be a lower-classed medium.

The Galleria degli Uffizi was originally created by Giorgio Vasari as offices for the government of Grand Duke Cosimo de' Medici I in 1561.<sup>136</sup> It was not until 1581 that Francesco I de' Medici established a room within the building to function as a space to hold paintings, sculpture and other precious memorabilia.<sup>137</sup> This room was only open to a very select group, however, in 1743, the Uffizi was declared to be "public and inalienable property."<sup>138</sup> The opening of the Uffizi to the public coincided with the establishment of the Grand Tour during the eighteenth century. This building was always related to nationalism and public service because underneath the foundations of the museum there was a medal inscribed with the words, "Publica Comoditati" or "public commodity."<sup>139</sup> The Uffizi was able to function as a symbol of both nationalism through effective governance and art. Thus, the Alinari did not have to prove to the British that this building carries the heavy weight of history, and in its place they are allowed to open up the image to the viewer.

The photograph of the Uffizi references both the building and the art contained within its galleries. The image is composed, with the two wings of the Uffizi rising up on either side, to force the viewer to feel weight of the Italian artistic tradition since even during the eighteenth

---

<sup>135</sup>Fratelli Alinari. Square of the Uffizi Gallery, JPG, <http://www.alinariarchives.it/internal/Default.aspx>.

See Figure 4.

<sup>136</sup> Gloria Fossi and Galleria degli Uffizi. 2001. *Uffizi gallery : Art, history, collections*. (Firenze: Giunti : Firenze Musei.) 8.

<sup>137</sup> Fossi, 8.

<sup>138</sup> Fossi, 10.

<sup>139</sup> Fossi, 11.

century the Uffizi was one of the most important stops on the Grand Tour. The wings originate outside of the picture frame which gives the viewer a sense of infinite regression and the heavy stone façade adds weight. These aspects imply the importance of the art held within and the longevity of the building itself. There are two people out in the distance that function as a ruler, measuring their bodies against the massive structure before them. Yet, even though the museum looms over the tiny spectators, this image is inviting. The path down the center of the photograph leads the eye to a bright white arch at the end. The viewer cannot see into the colonnade on the left side of the photograph, but the lighted columns and steps offer entrance. The Alinari want the viewer's eye to enter into the museum and view Italy's national heritage. The architecture of the Uffizi, in addition to the art inside the museum, functions as a point of national pride.

### Art and Nationalism

The Alinari were not alone in using the glorious artwork from the past in order to aggrandize the present. During the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, art and archeology functioned as a means of controlling the national identity by proving, domestically and internationally, that the country had a grand collective past. For example, the Museum of Northern Antiquities in Copenhagen was established in 1819 and proclaimed the developments by the early Dutch people during the Iron and Bronze Age.<sup>140</sup> The museum was established during the Napoleonic period when the Dutch suffered serious setbacks and this museum helped to reaffirm their dwindling sense of national pride.<sup>141</sup> Because, "Each emergent nation-state had to construct its own national identity, which required the active forgetting or

---

<sup>140</sup> Philip L. Kohl. Nationalism and archaeology: On the constructions of nations and the reconstructions of the remote past. *Annual Review of Anthropology* 27 (1998) : 223-46. 228

<sup>141</sup> Kohl, 228

misremembering...and the rediscovery or inventing of one's past," the act of photographing Italian art and architecture creates a dispersed museum.<sup>142</sup> It was a collection of the past that was both reproducible and mobile. Using an image of the Uffizi, especially one as grand and as imposing as this one, created a mental image of Italy in the minds of foreigners, dictating how the foreigners approached the new nation. If the themes of the photographs were that the structures were ancient, stable, strong, imposing and monumental, then the viewers began to associate Italy with the same adjectives.

The dissemination of images of art and architecture forced the viewers to form an image of the Italian nation based on symbols, which increasingly take over as text.<sup>143</sup> Susan Sontag, in her book, "On Photography," argued that, "In fact, words do speak louder than pictures."<sup>144</sup> Photographs cease to really mean anything without text, which is the only method of giving them meaning. However, through the reproducibility of these photographs, their subjects became symbols of the nation; the structure of the Uffizi was no longer a grand museum but a visual signifier for Italy as a country. As the images become more prevalent, the text became less necessary. These photographic images eventually became signifiers that relate so closely to the signifieds that they no longer needed the accompanying text. Due to their proliferation, these photographs had become almost universally accepted as the text. A photograph of the Eiffel tower did not need the caption stating either the title or the place where it could be found. Seeing images can even evoke similar responses to the place or word itself. For example, seeing a picture of the Statue of Liberty can cause the viewer to feel an intense wave of patriotism. The result of the use of this type of symbolism was a simplistic, if controllable, view of the nation. In order to control the perception of the nation, both domestically and internationally, was to

---

<sup>142</sup> Kohl, 228

<sup>143</sup> Kohl, 240

<sup>144</sup> Susan Sontag. *On Photography*. (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 1977), 108.

engage in nationalist mythmaking through the free press.<sup>145</sup> The Alinari, by flooding the market with the grand images of Florence, created the myth that all of Florence, and therefore Italy, looked like the circulated images.

The Tuscan state was already well aware of its arts as a means of artistic propaganda. For example, in 1859, after the exile of Duke Leopold and before the annexation of Tuscany into the rest of Italy, Riascoli, the Prime Minister of Tuscany, held artistic competitions that glorified the Risorgimento.<sup>146</sup> Riascoli admitted that, “Considering that in Tuscany the fine arts were always the noblest part of its civility, and that a National Government has the obligation to support them in whatever way is worthy of them, we summon them to eternalize great deeds and great men.”<sup>147</sup> Thus, even before the official integration of Tuscany into Italy and the move to Florence as the capital, there was already an emphasis on the artistic tradition as a source of nationalism. However, the focus of these competitions was paintings, not photography.

Unlike the Palazzo del Bargello and the Duomo, this is an image also devoted to the imagery inside its walls. The paintings inside the Uffizi are as much a part of the symbolism as the museum itself. Therefore, the Palazzo del Bargello and the Duomo work to refute the gaze of the viewer. In the case of the Bargello, the flat, undecorated wall keeps the eye from penetrating in order to view the Renaissance sculpture that had recently been moved into its rooms and courtyard. The Bargello forces the viewer to confront the building not as a museum, but as a medieval fortress. Even the Duomo confronts the viewer as standardized symbol of Florence. The entrance into the building itself would make it seem overly dependent on the Catholicism, instead of focusing on the rationality of the architectural feat. The Uffizi, in consequence, is entirely about entrance and accessibility, the lighting is still even, but it

---

<sup>145</sup>Jack L. Snyder. *From Voting to Violence : Democratization and Nationalist Conflict*. (1st ed. New York: Norton, 2000). 56.

<sup>146</sup>Albert Boime. *The Art of the Macchia and the Risorgimento : Representing Culture and Nationalism in Nineteenth-Century Italy*. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1993). 140

<sup>147</sup> Boime, 140



highlights the passages both around and through the building. It allows for the viewer to imagine entering into the building and viewing the famous artwork. Thus, the Alinari are not restricting the image of the Uffizi as only a single symbol of Florence, but also includes a reference to a multiplicity of other possible symbols.

The photograph of the Uffizi symbolizes Italian nationalism because it demonstrates that art and architecture are a part of the everyday existence in Italy. The composition is an open invitation into the image, proving that while Italy is home to famous Renaissance paintings; it is also available to everyone. All Italians are given access to the artwork, and this is what makes them different and superior from citizens of other nations. This is an image that requests the gaze and offers itself up wholly to the viewer. Since this photograph is still within the Alinari Style, all of the details are present and each choice of the original architect is made visible. The viewer who attends to each detail is awarded because the façade of the building is not a flat brick wall but covered in windows and ornamentation. For example, although it is not explicit, careful viewing of the columns rewards the viewer with glimpses of statues

The Uffizi demonstrates Italy's ability to move from privatized nobility to a nationalistic public. In photographing the Uffizi, the Alinari are at once asserting Barthe's assumption about the *noeme* of photograph as "that which has been." Yet, while at this photographs' most basic level this might be true, this is also a photograph documenting, "that which will be." The act of taking a photograph of the Uffizi, especially with a composition that leans towards grandeur and drama, also describes what Italy can become. Like the Uffizi, Italy was once a country devoid of populist power, however, eventually the Uffizi became open to the public, as will Italy. Through photographing the Uffizi, the Alinari are re-appropriating a building that used to be restricted to the nobility and selling it to the public.

### Photographic Presentation of Artwork

The Alinari photographed art in order to democratize it. However, using photography to document and disperse Art is not without effect on the reception of these works. Walter Benjamin's famous essay, "The Work of Art in the Age of its Technological Reproducibility," describes the effect of reproducing famous works of art through photography. Benjamin believes that by photographing a work of artwork and then disseminating the photograph throughout the population, the photograph lessens the aura that surrounds art. He argues that, "In even the most perfect reproduction, *one* thing is lacking: the here and now of the work of art – its unique existence in a particular place. It is this unique existence – and nothing else – that bears the mark of the history to which the work has been subject."<sup>148</sup> Therefore, a photograph will always lack that sense of history because it can be reproduced an innumerable amount of times. This reproducibility can be helpful because it allows for a large amount of information to be spread at a rapid, if not instantaneous, rate. However, it means that photographs do not have that sense of time that makes a building or monument from the Renaissance awe-inspiring. These buildings become testaments to human history; they allow for history to progress at an even and understandable rate. With the introduction of photography, time begins to both speed up and slow down since they can always be reproduced and made anew. Yet, its benefit is that information can be shared across space quickly, allowing for reactions to specific pieces of news to happen concurrently.

The act of photographing these monuments begins to give those in possession of the photographs possession over time. Creating a photograph means forever owning a piece of time. Architecture is susceptible to time because it is a single structure, one that can erode,

---

<sup>148</sup> Walter Benjamin.. Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction. In *Illuminations*. (1st ed., 211-244. New York: Harcourt, Brace & World, 1968). 21.

crumble, or be destroyed. While a single photographic print is more fragile than a building, its infinite reproducibility keeps it from becoming dependent on time. It can continually show what was in front of the camera's lens at that moment. Therefore, Barthes argues that the *noeme* of photograph is "that-has-been."<sup>149</sup> In this sense, the photograph is always referring back to a time that has passed. Photography has the ability to remind the viewer of the particular time in which the photograph was taken and that now it has passed. He continues, describing how in photography, there is always something which has posed, in this case it does not necessarily have to be alive, but it was before the camera and now it has been saved forever.<sup>150</sup> It can be reproduced and transported and the original object can be destroyed, yet the photograph will remain. In some ways, a building can be seen like a painting, something that while aged, has stood the test of time and will endure. In this sense, the act of photographing a famous and ancient structure is allowing that structure to enter into the modern age, to participate and to endure, even though it no longer has to be standing.

Barthes recognizes the ability of a photograph to bring back the dead, yet it is not in a way that is entirely satisfactory. To be specific, he finally finds a photograph of this recently deceased mother that seems to capture her essence.<sup>151</sup> He describes the experience, but at the same time, it will never truly be her again, because she is gone. In much the same way, the photographs of the Renaissance structures cannot bring back the time in which Italy was the tastemaker of Western Europe, yet, it can remind those visiting of its former power. Thus, it plays into a sense of tourism and consumerism that bypasses the more obvious and genuine sentiments that permeates Barthes writing on the subject of his mother.

---

<sup>149</sup> Roland Barthes. *Camera Lucida : Reflections on Rhotography*. (1st American ed. New York: Hill and Wang, 1981). 76.

<sup>150</sup> Barthes, 78

<sup>151</sup> Barthes, 65.

The subject of possession and everyone's right to ownership was very much in keeping with both nationalism and those who supported it, the bourgeoisie. Although the views of the Italians were not necessarily favorable, it was in keeping with contemporary middle-class values. The work ethic of the Alinari seemed to be consciously warring against the English impulse to see Italians as inherently aristocratic, decadent and amoral.<sup>152</sup> Therefore, the Alinari fit perfectly into this role as middle class artisans because the photograph, especially the photographic reproduction of a famous artwork was cheaper, more flexible and simpler to reproduce.<sup>153</sup>

### The Benefits of Photography

Painting could not accomplish the task of nationalism with the same effectiveness of the photograph. The Macchiaioli were painters working at the same time as the Alinari who believed in the "sketch," one of the many translations of "macchia" into English. The Macchiaioli were much more overtly nationalistic and great supporters of the Risorgimento, many of whose themes cropped up in their work. John Stewart, the critic for the English Art-Journal complained about the 1861 National Exposition:

"But this exhibition at Florence in its broad aspects has but two subjects – the cruelties of kingcraft and priestcraft, separate or in combination, and the struggles of the people to throw off the double-headed oppressor...All foreigners seem nearly equally astonished at this peculiarity of the pictorial section of the exhibition; and without the least desire to cross the forbidden boundary line of politics, a fact so conspicuously potent over the pictures exhibited cannot be entirely ignored."<sup>154</sup>

Therefore, the Macchiaioli were given to the task of infusing both Italians and foreigners with their sense of nationalistic pride.

Because these images were paintings, they did not have the same pull or power that a photograph or building would because painting had become accepted as a purely subjective

---

<sup>152</sup> Michele Falzone del Barbarò, Monica Maffioli, and Emanuela Sesti. *Alle Origini della Fotografia : Un Itinerario Toscano, 1839-1880*. (Firenze: Alinari, 1989). 17.

<sup>153</sup> Falzone del Barbaró, 21

<sup>154</sup> Boime, 173

medium. Although it was certainly used as means of documentation, it was at once too slow and too dependent on the artist's hand. His or her virtuosity determined how accurate the painting will be of reality. However, even more than the artist's ability (or inability) to show reality as it is, it was the fact that each brush stroke is deliberate. It was impossible for a painter to show everything exactly as it was and will always keep it from ever becoming a completely true replication of an event. Therefore, unlike photography, it was not inherently believable.

Painting's innate believability is also hampered by its history; it is an art form that resides almost completely with the elite and their agendas. Historically, it has been the byproduct of the elite and their academies. Painting traditionally requires years of study and a certain degree of innate talent. One had to have the means to go to art school and learn how to paint in the socially acceptable manner. Despite the goal of the Macchiaioli to break this tradition of elitism, painting's history is too engrained to be disabused so quickly. In keeping with the theme of elitism, paintings are only accessible to be viewed by a select group. They can be bought and placed into private homes, at which point they are completely out of the public sphere or they can be placed in museums. If they are in a public museum, and without the aid of photography, one must travel to that location in order to see it. Therefore, they are less effective in spreading a message due to its overt elitism and its inaccessibility.

Photography did not have the same burden of history that painting did nor was it sequestered away into imposing museums. When the Alinari were working in 1865, the photograph had only been in existence for about forty years and it had only been made public for about twenty-five. Although it was initially spearheaded by the nobility, since they had the time to spend on tinkering with the new technology, it was still infinitely less expensive than buying a painting. The other benefit was that by this point the negative to positive technique had been perfected which allowed for one negative to make an infinite amount of positive prints. The

photograph's reproducibility meant that instead of having one image placed in a museum, there could be thousands of the same image spread throughout the world. It made it possible for anyone and everyone to be able to see these images. Although the photograph's relationship with reality was complex, it was not dependent on the artist's hand and thus seemed to document the truth.

Etchings, also based on the artist's hand, were popular in the centuries directly preceding the worldwide acceptance of photography. Although on the surface it seemed as though etchings would satisfy the same requirements of photography, it still required more effort to create the etching itself. Finally, unlike a photograph, it was still just the replication of a drawing and did not carry the same connotations of veracity that a photograph would.

Architecture, unlike painting, is more in keeping with the nationalistic theme, although it is far more limited than photography. The benefit of monuments is that they are essentially public structures, which are far more accessible. Monuments exist within the space that is lived, unlike a painting in a museum which must be sought out or an etching that is purchased and lives in a private home. Anyone can walk by them and can feel a sense of ownership over these structures. People in New York, for example, feel a sense of ownership over the Empire State building, as a significant part of their skyline. This ownership allows the monument to become one of the most enduring symbols of the city, similar to the Eiffel Tower, it no longer needs text to explain the image.

Architecture does not reproduce the world in the same way that paintings, etchings or photographs can, however, it fits into the class structure set up by nationalism. Therefore, since the public essentially owns architecture, and if the architecture in a city is very beautiful, it becomes a point of pride. It is not dependent on the class of the individual living within the city, but the city as a whole. Nationalism asks the people to become the rulers of the new nations.

Therefore, like paintings, elitist institutions begin to crumble and a more inclusive model replaced the form of government that excluded those within its borders. Again, it is this inclusive model that allows people to believe as though they can “own” a part of their nation, and that this ownership is important.

Photography has the ability to turn architecture, which is confined to a particular location, and make its reach much wider. Therefore, it is not that Florence is a city that has beautiful monuments, but that Italy has beautiful monuments. The Alinari are able to show that this is the space in which Italians live, that they are superior because their country has these wonderful buildings. It is supposed to give all Italians a sense of pride in their achievement and prove that Italy is as important a country as any in Europe. Photography, nationalism and, to a degree, monumental architecture are all about control. Ownership means the ability to have a say in the processes, a say in what happens to the objects that are owned. For photography, with its ability to be manipulated and organized in a multiplicity of ways, allows people to feel as though they have a certain degree of control over the world around them.

The image of the Uffizi repels association with photography as an art form while simultaneously courting such a categorization. The image of the Uffizi is the most literally composed of the three images, unlike the photographs of the Palazzo del Bargello and the Duomo which present their subjects clinically; this one adds drama as the two sides of the museum tower over the viewer. The photograph alludes to the venerable art held within these walls that have influenced centuries of artists from all over the Western world. However, the Alinari do not deviate from their signature style, the light is still even and the image continues to be pragmatically clear. The photograph itself vacillates between the desire to be viewed as an art form in its own right and to be approached as solely a means of presenting reality.

The Alinari are able to form this iconography because they are taking photographs. The monumental quality to the photograph creates an aura to the building. The subject takes up all of the space provided. Yet, despite the imposing nature of the image, the object is a photograph, which mitigates the power of the image. Even though the people presented in the picture are only small shadows, dotting the wide street, the viewer is physically larger than the image. Thus, unlike a large painting which can envelope the viewer, the photograph is always controllable. They are small objects; as Sontag explains, “photographs which package the world seem to invite packaging. They are stuck in albums, framed and set on tables, tacked on walls, projected as slides. Newspapers and magazines feature them; cops alphabetize them; museums exhibit them; publishers compile them.”<sup>155</sup> Therefore, photographs are not threatening in the same way that a large painting can be; the English tourist who buys one of these images can control it. Such packaging and the infinite reproducibility undercuts the aura created by the Alinari in their compositions. Thus, the Alinari create a false aura through the composition of the work without compromising their desire to both prove that this was the world in which all Italians lived and that Italy required active participation from the viewer.

The incredible detail of the image is balanced by its simple geometry. The construction of the composition is the two walls, the piazza down the center, the white sky above and the archway in the background. The image appears to be an exercise in perspective; it seems to be proving the ease at which photograph can accomplish a relatively more difficult task when painting or drawing. However, it is also this simplicity that allows the image to be easily recognizable as the Uffizi and in turn become a symbol of Florence. The photograph is not successful unless a tourist can identify its location as a sight that has previously been visited.

---

<sup>155</sup> Sontag, 4



Therefore, even through the thick detail of the image, the Alinari are still creating an iconography for their city and country.

## Conclusion

In July of 1871, the capital of Italy moved one last time, leaving Florence for Rome. Although the Alinari continued to take photographs of Florence and Tuscany and beyond central Italy, their photographs no longer had the same symbolic resonance.<sup>156</sup> Instead of demonstrating the rich history of Florence, the photographs began to show how Florence was modernizing. They demonstrated how people in contemporary clothing, the construction of new buildings, and eventually the introduction of cars affected the ancient city. The Alinari no longer needed to show that Florence had the historical power to become the capital of a nation state, instead, Florence was finally given the freedom to grow and change organically.

Rome was the perfect choice for a capital because, unlike Florence, it did not have to prove its age, importance or symbolic qualities. It was the center of the Roman Empire, whose power, and political and intellectual achievements continued to be common knowledge. Rome was also the home of the Vatican, and therefore oversaw the spirituality of millions of people around the world. Rome was full of classical ruins, Renaissance art and Baroque architecture which attested to its involvement in all of the important movements that had occurred in Italy since its inception.

Despite the Alinari's efforts, the British never truly changed their views about the Italians and the Italian patrimony. Therefore, the Alinari were unable to use art to change politics and perception. Florence continued to be viewed as a destination resort town, one whose population simply added decoration to the beautiful surroundings. Even today, Italy is not perceived as a viable economic or military power. However, the images of the country abound; people want to visit the country, meet the inhabitants and then leave, to return to what they believe to be more

---

<sup>156</sup> Arthur James Beresford Whyte. 1965. *The Evolution of Modern Italy*. New York: Norton. 180.

highly industrialized and well-organized countries. Yet, the Alinari themselves became increasingly successful, regardless of outsider's perception of Italy.

The failure of the Alinari to categorically change the way in which the British dealt with the Italians is demonstrated in the E.M. Forester novel, A Room with a View, written in 1908. The British Edwardian characters discuss Italy as a theme park or a vacation spot, using many of the same terms that were used by other English tourists, two centuries earlier. In the book, two English women walk around Florence and mention the particularities of the city. The older woman, Miss Lavish discusses the characteristics of Florence, stating that, "One doesn't come to come to Italy for niceness...one comes for life! Buon giorno Buon giorno! Look at that adorable wine-cart, how the driver stares at us, dear, simple soul!"<sup>157</sup> In the quote, Miss Lavish firmly established Italy as a place where she could have an adventure. The people who populate Florence were naturally not as bright or as successful as the British women, and the Italians were props and the city of Florence, a resort.

The story continues as the protagonist, Miss Lucy Honeychurch suddenly has a moment in which she discovers the real Italy. Yet, this moment appears to be taken directly out of an Alinari photograph. She and Miss Lavish, the older woman, have wandered, lost into a piazza and Miss Honeychurch realizes with surprise, "For one ravishing moment Italy appeared. She stood in the Square of the Annunziata and saw in the living terra-cotta those divine babies whom no cheap reproduction can ever stale. There they stood, with their shining limbs bursting from the garments of charity, and their strong white arms extended against circlets of heaven. Lucy thought she had never seen anything more beautiful..."<sup>158</sup> At that particular moment, Italy became what the Alinari showed it to be. Thus, the Alinari were successful because they created

---

<sup>157</sup> Foster, E.M. 1908. *A Room with a View*. Project Gutenberg Etext #2641.  
<http://www.gutenberg.org/files/2641/2641-h/2641-h.htm> (accessed April 18, 2009).

<sup>158</sup> Foster, E.M. 1908. *A Room with a View*. Project Gutenberg Etext #2641.  
<http://www.gutenberg.org/files/2641/2641-h/2641-h.htm> (accessed April 18, 2009).

and marketed a version of Italy. It is probably from photographs and other images that taught the protagonist to believe that this is the true Italy, where this type of beauty exists around every street corner. Thus, the true Italy becomes only the street corners that the Alinari have chosen to photograph.

The Alinari even become a part of the story itself. Miss Honeychurch wandered off to buy photographs of the various paintings that she and her older cousin, Miss Charlotte Bartlet, saw. Although she describes the action of looking at the nude Venus in Sandro Botticelli's painting, The Birth of Venus, a pity, she dutifully buys the images of the paintings whose artists' names she recognizes. She even mentions that she went to the Alinari, not that she went to buy photographs, but that she went to this particular store and her fellow traveler understands exactly what she means.<sup>159</sup> Although the Alinari do not seem to be perfectly in line with English Edwardian values since it is a place where one can buy a picture of the naked Venus, it is also a place suitable for a lone young woman to buy images.

Although the British believe that Italians are inherently primitive, they also believe that the Italians are a single people. One of the major events in the book is when two Florentine men start a fight and one stabs the other. The moment is such a shock that it causes Miss Honeychurch to nearly faint, allowing for the integral love story to take place as the kind but odd Englishman George Emerson catches her.<sup>160</sup> In this scene, they discuss how the Italians are generally childish; they are unable to think rationally as even the generally young English are able to do. Yet, the British do not refer to the locals as Florentines or Tuscans, but as Italians. Thus, the British were convinced that Italy was a cohesive nation even if they believed that Italy was essentially primitive; one that could not compete with the rampant industrialization and modernization that was the inherent superiority due to being British.

---

<sup>159</sup> Foster 1908

<sup>160</sup> Foster 1908

Even though the book was made into a Merchant Ivory movie in the 1985, the British and American audiences found no problem with the portrayal of the Italians in the movie. The 1985 New York Times movie review noted the beauty of the story, the actors and the scenery, while making no mention of the role of the Italians in the film.<sup>161</sup> Instead, Italy was allowed to function solely as the backdrop onto which the lives of the English took place. They were foils, stripped of their narrative power to tell their own story and instead exist so that others can have a story to tell. Thus, even today, these views are unaltered.

Although the Alinari were unable to force the British to significantly alter their views of the Italians, as the century progressed, they became the most successful photography firm in Italy. In the mid 1870s and 1880s, the Alinari began to travel beyond Florence and the surrounding countryside, and instead began to photograph all of the major Italian cities.<sup>162</sup> In 1873, they published a new catalogue which presented many of the same subjects photographed in 1865, however, it was the first in which Luigi Bardi, the chalcographer, was not mentioned.<sup>163</sup> It was also during this period that the Alinari began to photograph all of the pertinent artwork throughout Italy in order to document its cultural history. While this took place after the capital moved from Florence to Rome, it showed that the Alinari continued to emphasize the cohesiveness of the Italian nation-state. However, the recipients of these views were anticipated to be both the tourists and the Italians. By 1881, the Alinari had produced 12,945 photographs detailing artwork throughout the peninsula.<sup>164</sup>

The 1880s became a significant period for photography in Italy due to the creation of the Società Fotografica Italiana on May 26<sup>th</sup>, 1889. The Society proved that Italy and Florence had joined with the rest of Europe since photographic foundations had already been established

---

<sup>161</sup> Vincent Canby. Movie Review: A Room with a View. *New York Times* 1986, sec Movies, 1986.

<sup>162</sup> Settimelli, Wladimiro, and Filippo Zevi. *Gli Alinari Fotografi a Firenze, 1852-1920*. (Firenze: Alinari, 1977). 30.

<sup>163</sup> Susanna Weber, and Ferruccio Malandrini. Fratelli Alinari in Florence. *History of Photography* 20, (Spring 1996): 51.

<sup>164</sup> Weber, 51

throughout most of the Western World.<sup>165</sup> In addition, photographers began to gain copyrights with the leadership of Giacomo Brogi, another well-known Florentine photographer.

In 1890 both Romauldo and Giuseppe died, and were succeeded by Leopoldo's son, Vittorio. It was under Vittorio that the firm shifted from a small, family-run firm to a national photographic concern. In 1893, Vittorio began to publish catalogues that were centered around a particular region, such as Firenze e Contorni, Provincia dell'Umbria and Roma, Dintorni e Provincia in addition to Venezia e il Veneto a year later.<sup>166</sup> The change in the firm's approach showed that instead of combining all of these images into a single catalog, the firm attempted to document all of Italy separately. Also, in 1893, the Alinari began to photograph both the ceiling of the Sistine Chapel as well as the Raphael rooms in the Vatican. The Alinari were no longer working strictly for tourists but had moved on to study aids for academics.

By the end of the nineteenth century, Alinari's clients and focus changed from tourists to museums and universities around the world who used these images as a means of studying Italian art without being required to go to Italy. It is also these images that continued to compel the Alinaris to use a style of photography that demanded that there be an incredible degree of clarity since people were beginning to use these images in lieu of the actual object. Vittorio ran the firm until the death of his son Carlo in 1920, upon which he sold it to Florentine entrepreneurs creating Alinari IDEA.<sup>167</sup> Between the death of his uncles and Carlo, Vittorio Alinari turned the firm into a famous portrait studio as well, taking pictures of popes, principles and kings.<sup>168</sup> After Vittorio sold the firm, it slowly began to acquire other photographic archives,

---

<sup>165</sup> Weber, 52.

<sup>166</sup> Weber, 52.

<sup>167</sup> Weber, 53.

<sup>168</sup> Weber, 52.

which, in addition, to the Alinari's substantial holdings, helped the Alinari Archives become one of the largest photographic archives today.<sup>169</sup>

The Alinari were simply too subtle. If the Alinari had been more obvious about their intent, changes could have been made. Therefore, in this case, art was unable to change politics and perception. Although their photographs were certainly beautiful and impacted the way that the rest of Europe saw Italy, it was simply too little too late. The English were already too-well established in their conception of Italy as a resort, with little regard to the people as important or to Italy's struggle for political independence and functionality. Instead, all of the same problems continued, England continued to believe that Italy was not a viable country in its own right and Italy's own political situation became mired in shambles. Plus, the actual events in history did not demand outsiders to think of Italy in different terms.

---

<sup>169</sup> Weber, 54.

## Appendix 1: Images



Figure 1



Figure 2



Figure 3



Figure 4



## Appendix 2: References

Anderson, Benedict R. O'G. *Imagined Communities : Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. Rev. and extended ed. London ; New York: Verso, 1991.

Anderson's work on nationalism is an accepted scholarly text on the subject. It describes how the concepts of nationalism are essentially an illusion that are perpetrated by those in power in order to convince the populist that they are a single people.

Barthes, Roland. *Camera Lucida : Reflections on Photography*. 1st American ed. New York: Hill and Wang, 1981.

Barthes has written a seminal work on the nature and theory behind photography. It is impossible to write about photography, especially in the theoretical sense without considering his work on the subject.

Baudelaire, Charles, and Jonathan Mayne. *Art in Paris, 1845-1862 : Salons and Other Exhibitions*. Landmarks in Art History; Cornell Paperbacks. Ithaca, N.Y: Cornell University Press, 1981

Baudelaire's critique of the 1859 Salon demonstrates the current view of photography as an acceptable art form. Baudelaire believes that photography cannot be considered art because it relies on truth instead of beauty. He argues that truth is democratic, it is something that everyone can understand, however, beauty must be taught. Therefore, beauty is the higher goal because it requires effort to understand.

Becchetti, Piero. *Fotografi e Fotografia in Italia, 1839-1880*. Roma: Quasar, 1978.

This book has a list of any and all Italian photographers up until its publication and gives a brief description on each one of them. It is useful for discovering who was working at the same time as the Alinari. The descriptions of the photographers are not in depth; however, it is good for specific dates along with all of the locations. Almost all of the other sources have cited this book.

Benjamin, Walter. Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction. In *Illuminations*. 1st ed., 211-244. New York: Harcourt, Brace & World, 1968.

Walter Benjamin wrote the seminal essay, "Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction" that describes the process of taking photographs of pre-existing artwork. He argues that while it allows for information that was once relegated to the elite to become widely disseminated, he also states that it decreases the aura or timelessness that an unreproduced work of art possesses. His views impact the reading of the Alinari photographs because one of their largest markets were photographic reproductions of Italian art and architecture.

Black, Jeremy *Italy and the Grand Tour*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2003.

This book details the experiences of English travelers during the eighteenth century in Italy. Specifically, the author emphasizes that the travelers were mostly upper class young men who would travel throughout Italy as a form of education. He describes the difficulties in both travel and accommodation during this time. Also, he explains the obsession with Classicism, which meant that travelers would flock to the Roman and Greek ruins. In fact, they would find these monuments much more important than the Renaissance and Medieval works that are so celebrated today. He also makes a point to note that travelers to Italy did not care much for the Italians themselves.

Bodleian Library. *Photography & the Printed Page in the Nineteenth Century : An Exhibition at the Bodleian Library, 27 November 2000 to 31 March 2001*. Oxford: Bodleian Library, University of Oxford, 2001.

The book held information regarding the early advancements and uses of photography.

Boime, Albert. *The Art of the Macchia and the Risorgimento: Representing Culture and Nationalism in Nineteenth-Century Italy*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1993.

The author described the ways in which the Macchiaoli, artists who were contemporaries of the Alinari, engaged in the project of nationalism in Italy. The book is useful because he searches through the images themselves as a means of showing how these artists were trying to encrypt ideas about Italian nationalism into their work.

Broude, Norma F. The Macchiaioli as "Proto-Impressionists": Realism, Popular Science and the Re-Shaping of Macchia Romanticism, 1862-1886. *The Art Bulletin* 52, (4) (December 1970): 404-14.

This article describes the painting movement occurring in Tuscany at the same time the Alinari were taking photographs of Florence. The Macchiaoli were very focused on the work of Courbet and were therefore very interested in rural Realism. They did not like the Impressionists, and there is a provincial air to their works. In some readings, the Alinari were much more modern than the contemporary Italian painters, if only in that the Alinari focused mainly on the city while the painters were entirely focused on the countryside.

Browning, Robert, Elizabeth Barrett Browning, and Anna Benneson McMahan. *Florence in the Poetry of the Brownings; Being a Selection of the Poems of Robert and Elizabeth Barrett Browning which have to do with the History the Scenery and the Art of Florence*. Chicago: A.C. McClurg & Co, 1904.

The Brownings were British expatriates living in Florence during the latter half of the nineteenth century. Both of them were well-known poets during their time. It is significant to note that they used Alinari photographs to illustrate their book of poetry on Florence, therefore, the Alinari must have been prevalent enough by the time to be included in such a well-known book of poetry.

Canby, Vincent. Movie Review: A Room with a View. *New York Times* 1986, sec Movies, 1986. The review of the movie "A Room with a View." It does not comment upon the treatment of the Italians in the movie.

Clark, T. J. In a Pomegranate Chandelier. *The London Review of Books*, 2006.

Clark describes Benedict Anderson's two books: Imagined Communities and Under Three Flags, Clark describes the modern and post-modern predicament and how nationalism became the modern form of religion.

Clarke, Graham. *The Photograph*. Oxford History of Art. Oxford, England: Oxford University Press, 1997.

Graham gives an extremely brief history of the photograph and describes how to "read" a photograph. He focuses on concepts such as the reality of the image versus actual reality; the perfection of the image - color versus black and white; the city in the photograph, the

portrait; the portrayal of the body; documentary photography; and the Cabinet of Infinite Curiosities.

Coe, Brian, Mark Haworth-Booth, and Victoria and Albert Museum. *A Guide to Early Photographic Processes*. Softback edition ed. London: Published by the Victoria & Albert Museum in association with Hurtwood Press, 1983.

This book will be useful because the Alinari worked during the beginning of photography itself and were very active in the technology side as well. This book explains the different processes

Colombo, Cesare, Susan Sontag, Fratelli Alinari, and Museo di Storia della Fotografia. *Italy : One Hundred Years of Photography*. Florence, Italy; New York, N.Y: Alinari; Distributed in the U.S.A. and Canada by Rizzoli International Publications, 1988.

This particular book begins discussing Italy in the 1880s; however, it deals with how Italy saw itself. The Alinari play a significant role in the book, showing how their firm became more and more established into Italian visual culture.

Dimock, George, and Lenox Library Association. *Caroline Sturgis Tappan & the Grand Tour : A Collection of nineteenth-century Photographs : July 10-September 11, 1982*. Lenox, Mass: Lenox Library Association, 1982.

The book demonstrates the relationship between an American tourist and the Grand Tour. Although there are no images or information that are helpful, there is a general sense that, especially after her friend who left the States to marry an Italian Viscount, that partaking of such an excursion meant that she was "free-thinking" and intelligent.

Falzone del Barbarò, Michele, Monica Maffioli, and Emanuela Sesti. *Alle Origini della Fotografia : Un Itinerario Toscano, 1839-1880*. Firenze: Alinari, 1989.

This is a book from an exhibition. This book seems to be questioning the creation of the city from the photograph, especially early photography. At first it talks about how the photograph helped to create the image of Florence through the use of the guidebooks that helped to start the concept of travel for the modern bourgeoisie.

Foster, E.M. 1908. *A Room with a View*. Project Gutenberg Etext #2641.

<http://www.gutenberg.org/files/2641/2641-h/2641-h.htm> (accessed April 18, 2009).

The novel was written in 1908 and describes the adventures of English tourists in Florence. The book describes that the stereotypes that were prevalent during the mid-nineteenth century were still active during the Edwardian era.

Fossi, Gloria, and Galleria degli Uffizi. 2001. *Uffizi gallery : Art, history, collections*. Firenze: Giunti : Firenze Musei.

Contains information about the Uffizi gallery.

Fraser, Hilary. *The Victorians and Renaissance Italy*. Oxford, UK ; Cambridge, Mass: Blackwell, 1992.

The author describes how during the Victorian period the concept of the Renaissance was created. At first, there was an emphasis on the High Renaissance, however, Ruskin argued that it supported an ideal of moral degradation which therefore cause there to be a shift towards the focus on the early Renaissance of Giotto and Dante. However, by the end of the

Victorian period, the High Renaissance had once again been accepted. She focuses on the Victorian preoccupation with the sepulcher of the Renaissance heroes and the emphasis on the over-indulgent high Renaissance, then she looks into the Pre-Raphaelites, the fiction during that time period and the historiography.

Fratelli Alinari. *Fratelli Alinari: The Archives, Printing Procedures in the Alinari Archives, the Photographic Files, the New Photographic Campaigns, the Art Printworks, the Publishing House, the Museum, the Library, the Instruments for Photography, the Image Presented and the Image Preserved, the Photographic Exhibitions*. Florence: Fratelli Alinari, 1993.

A book published by the Archivi Alinari that briefly discusses all of the different facets of the Archives. Not particularly descriptive, but it does show what kind of image the Archives are trying to portray.

----. The 'Palazzo del Bargello' in Florence. From the Alinari Archives. JPG,  
<http://www.alinariarchives.it/internal/Default.aspx> (accessed April 23, 2009).

----. The Apse of the Cathedral of Florence. Form the Alinari Archives. JPG,  
<http://www.alinariarchives.it/internal/Default.aspx> (accessed April 23, 2009).

----. Large Square of the Uffizi Gallery. From the Alinari Archives. JPG,  
<http://www.alinariarchives.it/internal/Default.aspx> (accessed April 23, 2009).

Gernsheim, Helmut, Alison Gernsheim, and Joint Author. *A Concise History of Photography*. New York: Grosset & Dunlap, 1965.

This book has a detailed description of the history of photography. Gernsheim mostly focuses on English, American and French photographers, but touches on all of the major developments of photography. This book is good because it also goes into the science of photography. He manages to talk about many of the major, English and French speaking, photographers who were contemporaries of the Alinari.

Hawthorne, Nathaniel. *Passages from the French and Italian Notebook*. The Complete Works of Nathaniel Hawthorne. Wayside ed. Vol. 10. Boston: Houghton, Mifflin, 1902.

In 1858 Hawthorne traveled through Italy and France. Although this is a bit too early, it does describe how tourists traveled through Italy during this period. It also shows that many of the Americans believed that Italians were a primitive people. Also, he seems to spend the majority of his time associating with other English speakers in Italy. He also appears to spend most of his time complaining about various aspects of Italy, normally pertaining to the weather, the moral degradation of Italy and the Italians in general

Hibbert, Christopher. *Florence: The Biography of a City*. 1st American ed. New York ; London: W.W. Norton & Co, 1993.

This book gives a description of Florence from the beginning up until the present. It shows the trajectory of its history and where the Alinari place exactly. Also, it will make clear the social dynamics already a part of the city when it becomes the capital of Italy.

Hobsbawm, E. J. *Nations and Nationalism since 1780 : Programme, Myth, Reality*. The Wiles Lectures. Cambridge England] ; New York: Cambridge University Press, 1990.

The book details the concepts behind nations and nationalism as essentially constructs that

originated in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. He shows how neither language, ethnicity or even religion were entirely to blame for the construction of nation-states. Instead, he argues that it is due to the belief that small economies could not survive and it was therefore more pragmatic for the smaller states to join together in order to compete in the new industrialized, capitalist economy. However, the concept of national identity had to be created which led to the more virulent and dangerous form of nationalism. Finally, he shows how much of the nationalist propaganda was from the top of the social structure and did not have a particularly strong effect on the lower strata, at least in the beginning.

Howard, Seymour. Early Manet and Artful Error: Foundations of Anti-Illusion in Modern Painting. *Art Journal* 37, (1) (Autumn 1977): 14-21.

The article discusses the Macchiaoli and their artistic practices; they would sketch en plein air but would create their finished products in the studios. Thus, all of their finished pieces have an overly studied quality that does not mesh well with the incoming French modernism. However, many of the sketches do have a similar affect to the great Impressionists. Therefore, the photographs, with their implied truth and spontaneity, are more modern than the painters during that time period.

Howells, William Dean, and Scott Bennett. *Indian Summer*. A Selected edition of W. D.

Howells, v. 11; variation: Howells, William Dean, 1837-1920.; selections.; 1968 ;; v. 11. Bloomington, Indiana University Press, 1971.

The novel is an account of a traveler in Italy.

Jolivet, Vincent, and Fratelli Alinari. *Memorie del Grand Tour nelle Fotografie delle Collezioni Alinari*. Firenze: Alinari, 2006.

Although the pictures are useful, the book spends most of its time describing the various cities on the Grand Tour as opposed to the theories pertaining the concept of the Grand Tour.

King, Ross. *Brunelleschi's Dome: How a Renaissance Genius Reinvented Architecture*. New York: Walker & Co, 2000.

The book has information about how Brunelleschi was chosen to become the architect and dates pertaining to its construction and completion.

Kohl, Philip L. Nationalism and Archaeology: On the Constructions of Nations and the Reconstructions of the Remote past. *Annual Review of Anthropology* (1998) 27: 223-46.

Nationalism requires the elaboration of a real or invented remote past. This article considers how archaeological data are manipulated for nationalist purposes, and it discusses the development of archaeology during the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries and the relationship of archaeology to nation-building, particularly in Europe. Contrasting conceptions of nationality and ethnicity are presented, and it is argued that the adoption of modern constructivist perspectives is incompatible with attempting to identify ethnic/national groups solely on the basis of archaeological evidence. The political uses of archaeology are also reviewed for the construction of national identities in immigrant and postcolonial states. The problematic nature of nationalistic interpretations of the archaeological record is discussed, and the essay concludes with a consideration of the

professional and ethical responsibilities of archaeologists confronted with such interpretations.

Mack Smith, Denis. *The Making of Modern Italy, 1796-1866*. New York: Holmes & Meyer, 1988. It describes the Risorgimento.

Marien, Mary Warner. *Photography : A Cultural History*. 2nd ed. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson Prentice Hall, 2006.  
This book focuses mostly on the history of photography in England and the United States. However, it does analyze the role of the photograph in society.

McCauley, Elizabeth Anne. *Industrial Madness : Commercial Photography in Paris, 1848-1871*. Yale publications in the History of Art; variation: New Haven: Yale University Press, 1994.  
This book describes what photographers were accomplishing in France during the nineteenth century. The book did not have much useful information but did offer examples about how to organize the thesis.

McKenzie, Ray. Scottish Photographers in Nineteenth-Century Italy: Robert Macpherson and His Contemporaries. *History of Photography* 20, (1) (Spring 1996): 33-40.  
The article examines the images of Italy created by Scottish photographers in the nineteenth century, with particular reference to the influence of Robert Macpherson on the Scottish photography scene. The author describes Macpherson's continuing connection with Scottish photography, despite living in Italy, through his involvement with the Photographic Society of Scotland, and suggests a connection between Macpherson and early images of Italy produced by James Dunlop. He traces the development of Macpherson's career, noting his participation in lecture programs and exhibitions organized by the Society, along with photographers including Thomas Sutton, James Anderson, Carlo Ponti, Pietro Dovizielli, C. G. H. Kinnear, and William Ramsay, and concludes by commenting on the Italian photographs and writings of Andrew Pringle.

Pelizzari, Maria Antonella. Nineteenth-Century Italian Photography: Selected Bibliography. *History of Photography* 20, (1) (Spring 1996).  
It presents a bibliography of articles, books and exhibition catalogues relating to photography in Italy during the nineteenth century.

Pelizzari, Maria Antonella. Bourgeois Spaces and Historical Contexts : Facets of the Italian City in Nineteenth-Century Photography. *Visual Resources*(1) (1996)12: 1-18.  
Pelizzari writes "through an examination of Italian nineteenth c. photography, I intend to point out the levels of complexity in this urban landscape. Paralleling the development of photographic technology from the early calotypes to commercially produced albumen prints, the photographer's social status shifted from that of the aristocrat-amateur to that of a middle class professional. The Italian commercial photographer became responsible for diffusing the country's image, and for creating specific categories of vision. Through the detailed survey of Italy produced by these photographers, the new country recognized its national identity".

Quinsac, Annie-Paule. Nineteenth Century Italian Painting in America: A Traveling Exhibition. *Art Journal* 32, (3) (Spring 1973): 302-4.

It gives a cursory outline of painting in nineteenth century Italy

Quintavalle, Arturo Carlo, and Fratelli Alinari. *Gli Alinari*. Firenze: Alinari, 2003.

This book shows how the photographs of Florence created a sense of a collective national identity directly after the Unification of Italy. He compares how in France they had a group of photographers take pictures of many of the major monuments throughout the country. Therefore, these pictures tried to show how these images of Florence are not only for the Tuscans, but also for the rest of Italy itself, thus showing that the proliferation of these images create a sense of a truly unified Italy, culturally as well as politically.

Quintavalle, Arturo Carlo, and Monica Maffioli. *Fratelli Alinari Fotografi in Firenze: 150 Anni che Illustrarono il Mondo: 1852-2002*. Firenze: Fratelli Alinari, 2003.

The book has information about the social impact of photography, specifically the first chapter which discusses how the Alinari created a shared identity for the newly unified state of Italy. He relates what the Italians were doing to what the French did with their own monuments. Therefore, the Renaissance began to equal Florence which was equivalent to all of Italy

Settimelli, Wladimiro, and Filippo Zevi. *Gli Alinari Fotografi a Firenze, 1852-1920*. Firenze: Alinari, 1977.

The book is a comprehensive biography of the Alinari. It gives a good outline of the trajectory of the firm, a brief history of Florence after the fall of the Grand Duke and some insight into the Alinari's decision to photograph artwork

Sisi, Carlo. *L'Ottocento*. Storia delle Arti in Toscana., ed. Annalisa Fineschi. Firenze, Italia: Edifir, 1999

It details the artwork in Italy during the 1800s, when the Alinari were active.

Smith, Graham, and Susanna Weber. Edgar Degas and Diego Martelli: L'oeil Dodak and the Fratelli Alinari. *History of Photography* 15, (Spring 1991): 45-6.

Shows that the photographs that the Alinari were taking were even affecting the "fine arts."

Snyder, Jack L. *From Voting to Violence : Democratization and Nationalist Conflict*. 1st ed. New York: Norton, 2000.

This book gave information regarding how the elites in a newly democratized society were able to control the population beneath them through the use of nationalism, which they spread through various media

Sontag, Susan. *On Photography*. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 1977.

Sontag begins to question that way in which people see and approach photographs. She shows that photographs are not bearers of truth as we are likely to believe. Instead, they are as subjective as any other art form, if not more so, simply because people are so apt to take them as truth. Also, Sontag argues that photographs are inherently meaningless without words to describe what is occurring in the image. She shows that the act of looking has become something active or at least we have convinced ourselves that the passive act of

looking is active. Taking a photograph has become the means in which people push reality farther away and allow themselves to construct it through the images they take.

Sussex: Bodiam Castle Gen. View. From Artstor. JPG,  
<http://library.artstor.org.ezproxy.library.tufts.edu/library/welcome.html> (accessed April 23, 2009)

Sweet, Rosemary. *British Perceptions of Florence in the Long Eighteenth Century*. (2007) Vol. 50.

Studies of the Grand Tour conventionally focus upon the art and antiquities of Italy rather than the urban environment in which the tourists found themselves, and they generally stop short in the 1790s. This article examines the perceptions and representations of Florence amongst British visitors over the course of the long eighteenth century up to c. 1820 in order to establish continuity between the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. It considers why it was that British travelers appeared to be particularly attracted to Florence: initially they responded to congenial and pleasant surroundings, the availability of home comforts, and a sparkling social life. In the later eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries Florence acquired new meanings for the British, who began to identify and admire a civilization which had been based upon mercantile wealth and liberty: the foundations for the Victorian celebration of Florence were laid. But the experience of Florence as a city had also changed: it was no longer simply the showcase of the Medici dukes. As a consequence the buildings, monuments, and paintings of the republican period, as well as the history which they embodied, came into focus for the first time

Tempesti, Fernando. *Aspetti della Fotografia Toscana dell'Ottocento : Catalogo della Mostra*. Firenze: Fratelli Alinari-I.D.E.A, 1976.

This is a catalog of an exhibition. Although the images are useful, there is not much description of them. They show what other Tuscan photographers were doing at the same time.

Turner, Jonathan. The Legacy of the Brothers Alinari. *ARTnews* 89, (Summer 1990): 85-6.  
The article is a brief description and shows how the United States sees the Archives.

Vitali, Lamberto. *Il Risorgimento nella Fotografia*, 1979.

The book contains photographs of the major characters in the Risorgimento. It shows how photography was already a prevalent force in creating a sense of national identity and pride through the images.

Weber, Susanna, and Ferruccio Malandrini. Fratelli Alinari in Florence. *History of Photography* 20, (Spring 1996): 49-56.

The article was a part of a special section on nineteenth-century photography in Italy. The writers trace the history of the Italian photographic firm Fratelli Alinari. The firm was founded in Florence in 1854 by Leopoldo Alinari and his brothers, Romualdo and Giuseppe, and won its first official recognition at the 1855 Exposition Universelle in Paris. In subsequent years, it extended its work beyond Italian scenery and buildings to include portraits and reproductions of works of art. This later move marked the start of the firm's specialization in art reproduction. The writers continue with a history of the firm's activities



from the late 1850s to the present day, noting that Alinari's current owner, Claudio De Polo, has revived all the firm's traditional activities.

Whyte, Arthur James Beresford. *The Evolution of Modern Italy*. New York: Norton, 1965.

The book is a history of Italy from the Austrian invasions up through World War I and Mussolini. He describes the causes and affects of the various movements towards emancipation and unification. This books has been helpful in discussing all of the major characters who were a part of the Risorgimento and who were involved in the political aftermath, especially because many of them where photographed by the Alinari.

Zannier, Italo. *Storia della Fotografia Italiana*. Grandi opere. Roma: Laterza, 1986.

It is a comprehensive history of the photograph in Italy. It does well to show how the photograph was integrated into Italian culture and who was working before, during and after the Alinari began in Florence. It also references briefly how the photograph was integrated into the Risorgimento and how photography differed in its usage throughout the entire peninsula

Zannier, Italo, and Paolo Costantini. *Cultura Fotografica in Italia : Antologia di Testi Sulla Fotografia, 1839-1949*. Cultura Visiva ;; 2. Milano, Italy: F. Angeli, 1985.

Primary sources dealing with the beginning of photography.